

Analysis of the Procurement of Civil Servants in Deli Serdang Regency (Study at the Regency Regional Personnel Agency Deli Serdang)

Wahyu Ramadhan¹, Rudi Salam Sinaga², Adam³

^{1,2,3}Universitas Medan Area, Indonesia

Abstract

This study aims to determine the Procurement of Civil Servants in Deli Serdang Regency. This study used qualitative approach. The result of the study Procurement of civil servants at the Regional Pegadaian Agency of Deli Serdang Regency is carried out through the stages: planning, determining requirements, announcements, applications, which are then followed by screening and appointment to civil servant candidates, followed by appointment to civil servants. The constraint factors faced in the implementation of the procurement of civil servants are: the lack of a number of qualified applicants so that there is a compulsion to accept applicants whose test scores are less than standard, supervision of the procurement process is difficult because there are so many parties with an interest in the procurement process even high-ranking government officials. Also take advantage of the procurement process for their personal interests, as well as efforts by civil servant applicants to approach government officials by giving bribes to graduate as civil servants.

Keywords

procurement; civil servants;
Deli Serdang



I. Introduction

The performance of local governments is highly dependent on the performance of human resources (HR), namely civil servants in the area concerned. HR is a very important driving factor that cannot even be separated from an organization or agency. HR is the key that determines the level of organizational success, so it is often said that employees as HR are the most valuable asset or resource in an organization. Human resources in the form of human labor act as movers, thinkers and planners to achieve the goals of the organization. The head of the agency will strive to have reliable employees and always encourage these employees to show high performance by working in a timely manner with work results or performance in accordance with established standards.

Performance is a person's success in carrying out tasks, work results that can be achieved by a person or group of people in an organization in accordance with their respective authorities and responsibilities or about how a person is expected to function and behave in accordance with the tasks that have been assigned to him and the quantity, quality and time spent on the task. Each employee has different work abilities in doing the assigned tasks. (Wulandari, R. et al. 2021)

The term performance or work performance comes from the English word "performance". According to Khan in Busro (2018), performance is defined as work ability in terms of quality and quantity. Performance is a work performance (performance) both in

quantity and quality achieved by someone during a certain period, usually within one year.(Purba and Sudibjo, 2020)

Therefore, every government organization must carry out good management of human resources. The management of employee human resources is intended so that the organization can meet the needs of human resources in adequate numbers and have competencies that are able to carry out quality local government tasks in accordance with established regulations. HR management carried out includes: planning, procurement, training, development, assessment, promotion, transfer, demotion and so on. But what is discussed in this study is the procurement and transfer of employees.

Procurement of employees is the most important HRM operational function, which is intended to obtain the right number and types of employees to meet the needs of employees in order to achieve organizational goals. Procurement of Civil Servants is an activity process to fill vacant formations. Formation vacancies in an organizational unit are generally caused by the existence of a civil servant who quits, dies, changes positions and there is organizational development. Procurement of employees in the government is an important, difficult, and complicated problem, because to get and place competent people in various fields of government work that is relatively very broad and complex is not as easy as recruiting employees in the organization.

Procurement of employees within the government is regulated based on Government Regulation no. 98 of 2000 concerning the Procurement of Civil Servants. In article 1 it is stated that the procurement of civil servants is an activity to fill vacant formations, which is carried out by the staffing officer. While in article 2 it is stated that the stages of employee procurement, namely: Procurement of Civil Servants is carried out starting from planning, announcement, application, screening, appointment of Candidates for Civil Servants to appointment to become Civil Servants, where every citizen has the same opportunity to apply to become Civil Servants employees after fulfilling the specified conditions.

II. Review of Literature

2.1 Public Policy

Public policy according to Thomas Dye (2011: 1) is "whatever the government chooses to do or not to do (public policy is whatever governments choose to do or not to do)". The concept is very broad because public policy includes something that the government does not do in addition to what the government does when the government faces a public problem. For example, when the government finds out that there is a damaged road and it does not make a policy to fix it, it means that the government has already taken a policy. Thomas Dye's definition of public policy implies that (1) the public policy is made by a government agency, not a private organization; (2) public policy concerns the choices that government agencies should or should not make. Anderson (2012:3) defines "public policy as a policy set by government agencies and officials". Although it is realized that public policy can be influenced by actors and factors from outside the government.

In David Easton's view, when the government makes public policy, at that time the government allocates values to the community, because every policy contains a set of values in it (quoted Dye, 2011: 3). For example, when the government enacted Law no. 22 of 1999 and later replaced by Law no. 23 of 2004 concerning local government, it appears that the values to be pursued are respect for democratic values and empowerment of local communities and local governments.

Policy analysis is a review process that includes five components, and each component can be transformed into another component through certain methodological procedures, such

as problem formulation, forecasting, recommendations, monitoring, and evaluation. For example, forecasting procedures will produce policy futures, and recommendations will produce policy actions, and monitoring will produce policy results, and evaluation will produce policy performance. Conducting policy analysis means using the five methodological procedures, namely formulating policy problems, forecasting, making recommendations, monitoring, and evaluating policies.

2.2 Human Resources

Human resources in organizations need to be managed professionally in order to achieve a balance between the needs of employees and the demands and capabilities of the company's organization. This balance is the main key for the agency to develop productively and fairly. The development of businesses and organizations is very dependent on the productivity of the workforce in the company. With professional human resource management arrangements, employees are expected to work productively. This professional management of employees must start from employee recruitment, selection, upgrading and career development.

Like other human sciences, there is no one universally accepted definition of human resources. Each expert and author of the book provides a different definition of each other. According to Hasibuan (2016: 244) that Human Resources are an integrated ability of the individual's thinking power and physical power. Actors and their nature are carried out by their descendants and their environment, while their work performance is motivated by the desire to fulfill their satisfaction. According to Mathis and Jackson (2012: 3) that "HR is the design of formal systems in an organization to ensure the effective and efficient use of human talent to achieve organizational goals".

2.3 Employee Procurement

ASN employees consist of Civil Servants (PNS), namely Indonesian citizens who meet certain requirements who are appointed as ASN Employees on a permanent basis by the Civil Service Supervisor to occupy government positions, and Government Employees with Work Agreements (PPPK), namely Indonesian citizens who fulfill certain conditions that are appointed based on a work agreement for a certain period of time in order to carry out government duties (Prasetyo, 2014:13).

Procurement of Civil Servants is an activity carried out to fill vacant formations, meaning that the vacant formations are caused by Civil Servants who quit, retire, die or expand the organization which is then stipulated in the decision of the Minister who is responsible for the utilization of the state apparatus.

According to Prasetyo (2014:29), because the purpose of the procurement of civil servants is to fill vacant formations, the procurement must be based on needs, both in terms of number and competence of the required positions. Every Indonesian citizen has the same opportunity to apply to become a Civil Servant Candidate (CPNS) after fulfilling the predetermined requirements, these requirements may not be based on gender, ethnicity, religion, race, class, or region of origin because of the procurement of civil servants. This system uses a merit system where this system is based on objectivity in the management of ASN which makes it the choice for various organizations to manage HR.

In its procurement, Civil Servants are only allowed within the established formation limits by prioritizing delegation/withdrawal employees from Government Departments/Institutions, Non-Departments/Regional Governments that are overstaffed, students/college students who have graduated, health workers who have completed their term of service as non-permanent employees, and other highly needed personnel.

Appointments as Candidates for Civil Servants can be made for those who have exceeded the age of 35 years but must not exceed the age of 40 years. The appointment is carried out based on special needs and is carried out selectively for those who have served the Government both in the Central Government and Regional Governments for at least 5 consecutive years before the promulgation of Government Regulation No. 11 of 2012.

Personnel Development Officers (PPK) carry out the procurement of CPNS referring to Government Regulation Number 98 of 2000 as amended to Government Regulation Number 11 of 2002 concerning Procurement of Civil Servants whose implementation provisions are regulated in the Decree of the Head of BKN Number 11 of 2002 concerning Provisions for Implementation of Government Regulation Number 98 of 2000 concerning the Procurement of Civil Servants (Kepka BKN No. 11 of 2002) and the Regulation of the Head of the State Personnel Agency Number 30 of 2007 concerning Guidelines for the Implementation of Procurement of Candidates for Civil Servants (Perka BKN No. 30 of 2007), to be precise in Appendix II which regulates the guidelines for the implementation of CPNS procurement. Thus the implementation of the CPNS procurement is carried out starting from the planning, announcement, application, and screening.

2.4 Process of Planning and Organizing Civil Servants

Based on Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Management of Civil Servants:

a. Compilation

In the preparation and need for the number and type of PNS positions, it is carried out in accordance with the budget cycle, the implementation is seen based on position analysis and workload analysis in each Government Agency which is carried out within a period of 5 (five) years and is broken down into 1 (one) year based on the priority needs. In the context of preparing the needs of civil servants, several things will be considered, such as the dynamics/development of the Ministries/Institutions organization in order to achieve the goals of Government Agencies. The types of positions available consist of Administrative Positions, Functional Positions and High Leadership Positions. The details of the needs of civil servants in each year are compiled based on the results of the analysis of the position and the results of the workload itself.

b. Determination of Needs

Determination of needs is determined by the Minister every year by taking into account the opinion of the Minister who carries out government affairs in the financial sector and technical considerations of the Head of BKN submitted to the Minister at the end of June of the previous year. After that, the Minister prepares a plan to fulfill the needs of civil servants in terms of national development priorities, which are submitted by the Minister to the Minister who carries out government affairs in the financial sector to ask for opinions no later than the end of April for plans to fulfill the needs of civil servants in the following year. The determination of the need for civil servants is carried out based on the proposal from the Central Agency PPK and the Regional Agency PPK coordinated by the Governor.

c. Procurement

Procurement is carried out in order to fill the need for Administrative Positions (especially in Implementing Positions), Expert Functional Positions (especially in first expert Functional Positions and young expert Functional Positions), and Skills Functional Positions (especially for beginners and skilled Functional Positions). In ensuring objectivity in the procurement of civil servants nationally, the Minister forms a national selection committee

chaired by the Head of BKN. The national selection committee for the procurement of civil servants has the task of designing a selection system for civil servant procurement, compiling basic competency selection questions, coordinating Functional Positions fostering agencies in the preparation of field competency selection materials, recommending to the Minister the threshold for passing the basic competency selection for each Government Agency.

d. Rank and Position

Rank is a position that shows the level of position based on the level of difficulty, responsibility, impact, and job qualification requirements that are used as the basis for testing. PNS positions consist of administrative positions based on levels from the highest to the lowest are the Administrator Position which is responsible for leading the implementation of all public service activities as well as government administration and development, the Supervisory Position is responsible for controlling the implementation of activities carried out by implementing officials, and the Implementing Position is responsible for carry out public service activities as well as government administration and development.

III. Research Methods

This research was conducted from January 2021 to June 2021. This research was carried out at the Regional Personnel Agency Office of Deli Serdang Regency Jl. Rose No. 2 Deli Serdang Regent Office Complex. The research approach used in this study is a qualitative approach, namely problem solving procedures investigated by describing the current state of the subject/object of research based on visible facts. The nature of this research is descriptive explanatory which provides a detailed description of the background, nature and character of the case under study (Sugiyono, 2012:39).

Resource persons or informants are people who can provide the main information needed in a study. Informants are people who are used to provide information about the situation and condition of the background (location or place) of research (Moleong, 2010:132). The technique used to determine informants in this qualitative research is explained by Prastowo (2011: 197), namely by way of researchers entering certain social situations, making observations, and interviewing people who are seen to know about these social situations.

IV. Result and Discussion

Procurement of employees is an activity to fill vacant job positions. Through the procurement of employees, it is hoped that a number of employees who have competence in accordance with the job requirements have been determined in the job description. The discussion of employee procurement in this study at the BKD of Deli Serdang Regency is based on Government Regulation no. 98 of 2000 concerning the Procurement of Civil Servants. The regulation regulates the stages of employee procurement, starting from planning, determining requirements, announcements, applications, which are then followed by screening and appointment to civil servant candidates, followed by appointment to civil servants.

4.1. Planning, Determination of Requirements, Announcements and Applications

PNS procurement planning is the first step in the procurement of employees, which aims to determine the number of new employee needs to be withdrawn in accordance with the requirements needed in the vacant position that will be placed by the employee. The results of interviews regarding this matter are as follows:

The results of the interview with Darwin Zein, S.Sos as the Regional Secretary of Deli Serdang Regency:

"Employee procurement planning is carried out based on the current and future needs of employees, so that the cadre can continue to run well".

The results of the interview with Yudi Hilmawan, SE., MM, as the Head of the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The number of employees is a requirement for employees to fill vacant positions, so it is hoped that all positions can be filled according to their qualifications".

The results of the interview with Kamaluddin, SE as the Head of Procurement, Transfer and Information at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"There are certainly more and more vacant positions over time so planning for employee withdrawals must be carried out periodically".

The results of the interview with Sukirman, S.Sos, as the Head of the Sub-Division of Procurement of Employees at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"In the planning stage, the number of personnel procurement is determined according to the requests of employees from various agencies within the local government."

The results of the interview with Dosi Iswanto, ST as the CPNS Selection Applicant in 2019:

"In every PNS acceptance, it is clearly stated how much is needed for each field".

With the announcement of the procurement of employees, the public will make an application in accordance with the requirements set by the procurement committee. The results of interviews regarding this matter are as follows:

The results of the interview with Darwin Zein, S.Sos as the Regional Secretary of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The procurement committee will prepare everything to receive applicants, so that applicants can be served properly, for further processing in accordance with applicable regulations".

The results of the interview with Yudi Hilmawan, SE., MM, as the Head of the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The procurement committee has certainly prepared itself to receive the application letter and its requirements. A deadline has also been set so that applicants will drop their applications immediately."

The results of the interview with Kamaluddin, SE as the Head of Procurement, Transfer and Information at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

“PNS applications are always followed by many candidates, from various regions and various educational backgrounds. This is certainly an important job for the procurement committee.”

The results of the interview with Sukirman, S.Sos, as the Head of the Sub-Division of Procurement of Employees at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The procurement committee must accept applications from applicants and carry out a careful process in checking all administrative completeness that has been determined by the procurement committee".

The results of the interview with Dosi Iswanto, ST as the CPNS Selection Applicant in 2019:

"There are many applicants who are interested in becoming civil servants, so the number of applicants is very large".

The results of the interview with Dzulfi Sintya Lubis, SE as the Applicant for the 2019 CPNS Selection:

"I became a civil servant applicant after a long time planning and wanting to become a civil servant".

From the results of the interviews above, it can be explained that the procurement committee must immediately receive and examine applications submitted by applicants, the purpose of which is to check whether the application letter has met the specified requirements. The examination carried out at this stage is an administrative examination submitted by the applicants to determine the completeness of the application file, which will be further examined by the procurement committee.

4.2. Filter

The most important part or stage in the recruitment of employees is the screening of applicants. Screening is carried out to select or determine which applicants will be accepted as employees as a result of procurement by the employee procurement committee. Screening is carried out through three stages, namely: administrative examination, examination implementation, which ends with the determination of graduation.

Administration Check:

Each file submitted by the applicants will be examined carefully by the procurement committee whose purpose is to find out whether the applicant can meet the administrative requirements for further screening. The results of interviews regarding this matter are as follows:

The results of the interview with Darwin Zein, S.Sos as the Regional Secretary of Deli Serdang Regency:

"Administrative checks are carried out to determine whether applicants meet the requirements to take part in further screening stages, in accordance with established regulations".

The results of the interview with Yudi Hilmawan, SE., MM, as the Head of the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"Only applicants who meet the administrative requirements are allowed to take the screening in the form of a screening test, because administrative requirements are basic requirements".

The results of the interview with Kamaluddin, SE as the Head of Procurement, Transfer and Information at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The initial qualifications of the applicant can be known from the administrative requirements given by the applicant, so that if they do not meet the requirements, the applicant will be disqualified".

The results of the interview with Sukirman, S.Sos, as the Head of the Sub-Division of Procurement of Employees at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The committee must really be able to guarantee that only applicants who meet the administrative requirements can be allowed to take the selection exam, so administrative checks become an important part of the screening".

The results of the interview with Dosi Iswanto, ST as the CPNS Selection Applicant in 2019:

"The examination of application documents is of course important to ensure the eligibility of applicants".

Screening Exam:

The screening examination is a further stage of screening after the administrative examination of applicants. The things that the committee does in the competency exam are: exam preparation and exam implementation. The results of interviews regarding the preparation of the applicant's competency exam are as follows:

The results of the interview with Darwin Zein, S.Sos as the Regional Secretary of Deli Serdang Regency:

"Preparation for the competency exam as a form of screening is carried out by the selection committee in accordance with the rules that have been set, so that the exam can actually produce prospective employees who meet the requirements".

The results of the interview with Yudi Hilmawan, SE., MM, as the Head of the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"There are many things that must be prepared in the implementation of the exam, such as preparation of exam materials to the exam venue, so that during the implementation it can run smoothly".

The results of the interview with Kamaluddin, SE as the Head of Procurement, Transfer and Information at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The exam schedule must be prepared and announced immediately so that its implementation can be known by all applicants who are declared to meet the administrative requirements".

Determination of Graduation:

The graduation of the examinees is the most important part of the screening process, where participants or applicants who are declared to have passed have the right to be appointed as candidates for civil servants. Determination of graduation is determined by the committee and determined by the pawnshop supervisor. The determination of graduation is

based on the results of the exams that have been carried out, where only participants with test results that match the standards will be determined to pass as candidates for civil servants. The results of interviews regarding this matter are as follows:

The results of the interview with Darwin Zein, S.Sos as the Regional Secretary of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The applicant who has the best score will certainly be passed as a civil servant candidate, because graduation is determined based on the results of the exam that has been held".

The results of the interview with Yudi Hilmawan, SE., MM, as the Head of the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The graduation of participants or applicants is determined based on the results of the procurement committee's examination of the test results of each participant, so it is hoped that highly competent participants will be passed as candidates for civil servants".

The results of the interview with Kamaluddin, SE as the Head of Procurement, Transfer and Information at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The results of the competency exams that have been held are the main basis for determining the candidate's graduation, which is done by sorting all participants from the highest score to the lowest score".

4.2. Appointment of Civil Servants

The final stage of the recruitment process is the appointment of prospective civil servants to become civil servants. Appointments are made after the employee in question undergoes a probationary period of 1-2 years in his work area. The results of interviews regarding this matter are as follows:

The results of the interview with Darwin Zein, S.Sos as the Regional Secretary of Deli Serdang Regency:

"Prospective civil servants will be appointed as civil servants after fulfilling various stipulated requirements, and the maximum period is 2 years from the date of appointment as prospective civil servants".

The results of the interview with Yudi Hilmawan, SE., MM, as the Head of the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"The fulfillment of the element of work performance during the probationary period or during the status as a prospective civil servant is important to be able to be appointed as a civil servant after the probationary period is completed".

The results of the interview with Kamaluddin, SE as the Head of Procurement, Transfer and Information at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

"Prospective civil servants must go through pre-service education and training and be declared passed in order to be appointed as civil servants. Candidates for civil servants who do not meet the requirements will not be appointed as civil servants.

The results of the interview with Sukirman, S.Sos, as the Head of the Sub-Division of Procurement of Employees at the Regional Personnel Agency of Deli Serdang Regency:

“Physical and spiritual health is a requirement for the appointment of prospective civil servants to become civil servants, in addition to other requirements. The fulfillment of all requirements is certainly an important factor for civil servants”.

The results of the interview with Dosi Iswanto, ST as the CPNS Selection Applicant in 2019:

“I was appointed as a civil servant after fulfilling the requirements set”.

The results of the interview with Dzulfi Sintya Lubis, SE as the Applicant for the 2019 CPNS Selection:

“I received the appointment from a civil servant candidate to a civil servant in just one and a half years”.

From the results of the interview above, it can be explained that candidates for civil servants who are appointed as civil servants are only those who already have the requirements, which include: having a relatively good work performance value during the probationary period in their work area, has been declared graduated from pre-service education and training, and has a history of good health, that is, physically and mentally healthy.

V. Conclusion

Procurement of civil servants at the Regional Pegadaian Agency of Deli Serdang Regency is carried out through the stages: planning, determining requirements, announcements, applications, which are then followed by screening and appointment to civil servant candidates, followed by appointment to civil servants.

The constraint factors faced in the implementation of the procurement of civil servants are: the lack of a number of qualified applicants so that there is a compulsion to accept applicants whose test scores are less than standard, supervision of the procurement process is difficult because there are so many parties with an interest in the procurement process even high-ranking government officials. also take advantage of the procurement process for their personal interests, as well as efforts by civil servant applicants to approach government officials by giving bribes to graduate as civil servants.

References

- Anderson James E. (2012). Public Policy Making, New York, Holt, Rinehart and Wiston.
- Dye, Thomas R. 2011. Understanding Public Policy.3th (Englewood Cliffs, NJ; Prentice Hall.
- Fetrina, Elvi. 2017. Analisis Kebutuhan Pegawai Berdasarkan Perhitungan Beban Kerja Pegawai (Studi Kasus: Fakultas Sains dan Teknologi UIN Syarif Hidayattullah Jakarta). Jurnal Sistem Informasi, 10(2), 2017, 71-76.
- Hasibuan, Malayu S.P. (2016). Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia (Edisi Revisi). Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
- Howlett, Michael dan Ramesh, M. (2013). Studying Public Policy: Policy Cycles and Policy Subsystem. Oxford University Press, Canada.
- Khairunazri. 2012. Analisis Pengadaan Pegawai Honorer di Kabupaten Bengkalis. Jurnal online UGM, <http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id>.

- Mathis, Robert L. dan Jhon H. Jackson. (2012). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- Moleong, Lexy J. (2010). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Rosda Karya.
- Muslich, M. (2009). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Nawawi, H. Hadari. (2012). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Untuk Bisnis Yang Komperatif*, Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University Press.
- Nugroho, Riant D. (2011). *Kebijakan Publik (Formulasi, Implementasi, dan Evaluasi)*. Jakarta: PT. Elex Media Komputindo.
- Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 43 Tahun 1999 tentang Pokok-Pokok Kepegawaian
- Peraturan Pemerintah No. 98 Tahun 2000 tentang Pengadaan Pegawai Negeri Sipil.
- Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 Tentang Manajemen Pegawai Negeri Sipil
- Peraturan Badan Kepegawaian Negara No. 5 Tahun 2019 tentang Tata Cara Pelaksanaan Mutasi.
- Prastowo. (2011). *Motode Penelitian*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Purba, K. and Sudibjo, K. (2020). The Effects Analysis of Transformational Leadership, Work Motivation and Compensation on Employee Performance in PT.Sago Nauli. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*. P. 1606-1617.
- Purwoko, Anang Pikukuh. 2011. Sistem Pengadaan Pegawai Negeri Sipil yang Efektif. *Jurnal Kebijakan dan Manajemen PNS VOL. 5, No.2, November 2011*.
- Ranupandojo, Heidjrachman dan Suad Husnan. (2014). *Manajemen Personalia*, Yokyakarta : BPFE.
- Sugiyono. (2012). *Metode Penelitian Administrasi*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Suyatno. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Jakarta: Masmedia.
- Syakdiah. 2016. Manajemen Aparatur Sipil Negara. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik*. Vol. 5 No. 2. Januari 2016.
- Winarno, Budi. (2012). *Kebijakan Publik (Teori, Proses, dan Studi Kasus)*. Yogyakarta: Buku Seru.
- Wulandari, R. et al. (2021). The Influence of Delegative Leadership Style, Motivation, Work Environment on Employee Performance in Self-Efficiency Mediation in SNVT Housing Provision of East Java Province. *Budapest International Research and Critics Institute-Journal (BIRCI-Journal)*. P. 3294-3311.