

## Adaptation Modes in Indonesian Subtitle of Enola Holmes (2020) Movie

Alika Kamilia Basar<sup>1</sup>, Ida Zuraida<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>English Department, Faculty of Humanities, Widyatama University, Indonesia  
[alika.kamilia@widyatama.ac.id](mailto:alika.kamilia@widyatama.ac.id), [ida.zuraida@widyatama.ac.id](mailto:ida.zuraida@widyatama.ac.id)

### Abstract

*Movie is the most popular entertainment medium, which is liked and enjoyed by the majority of people around the world. Since a lot of movies are produced in one language but watched by people who speak in different languages, subtitle becomes the important way of conveying the utterances in the movie. However, literal translation is not possible in subtitling because of the differences in the sociocultural aspects and language structure. Therefore, the oblique translation technique is often used in the subtitling, consisting of transposition, modulation, equivalence, and adaptation. This study aims to examine adaptation modes applied in Indonesian subtitle of Enola Holmes (2020) movie using the qualitative descriptive comparative method. Data collection was performed by collecting data from the movie broadcasted by Netflix. Data analysis is carried out by comparing the Indonesian subtitle with the utterance using the data analysis technique by Krippendorff and Nazir. As the result, seven adaptation modes by Baker and Saldahan were applied in the translated subtitle. The frequency of applied adaptation mode consists of 14 times of Transcription of Original, 4 times of Omission, 2 times of Expansion, 14 times of Exoticism, 5 times of Updating, 11 times of Situational or Cultural Adequacy, and 1 time of Creation. The finding of the study indicates that adaptation modes can be applied when translating utterance to text.*

### Keywords

translation; oblique translation;  
adaptation; adaptation modes;  
enola holmes (2020) movie



## I. Introduction

Translation is important to break the language barrier and obtain information or knowledge from around the world. Translating is not only about replacing the language from the source language by a target language in a word-by-word manner. It actually consists of a more of complicated process. Differences in culture, perspectives, environment, and social context need to be considered when one is translating spoken utterances or written texts. As cited by Herman and Rajagukguk (2019), Catford stated that translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL). It means that the result of translation might slightly be different from the SL but still carries the equal meaning. A good translation that is able to convey the meaning and feelings of the source language is crucial in making creative works such as novels, comics, and movies well understood and perceived by the readers or audience.

Movie is the most popular entertainment medium, which is liked and enjoyed by the majority of people around the world. The concept of audiovisual as an entertainment has made movies a media to communicate and to introduce cultures to people globally. Each movie has their own message, intended to be heard by its audience. However, not everyone understands the language used in the movie. Movies come from various countries with

various languages. Most of them carries the terms, idiom, or even jokes that only known in their country. Thus, to deliver the message of the movie, dubbing and subtitling are performed to make the movie well understood by its audience. While dubbing is preferred by some people as it exchanges the audio of the movie into a different language, subtitling is still considered the most favorable way of translating utterances in movies.

Subtitling is a process of transferring information from an audiovisual medium into a text. As cited by Fitria (2014), Gottlieb describes subtitle as rendering the verbal message of filmic media in a different language, presented on the screen along with the audiovisual. Bagheri M and Nemati A (2014) also pointed that subtitling is known as providing translated text under the screen. Meanwhile, dubbing is defined as translating a movie from an audiovisual media into another audiovisual media, but in another language. Since subtitling uses text as the media to deliver the translation of the movie, it requires more techniques in order to communicate the message perfectly to the audience. In the process of making a subtitle, unlike the normal translation that has no limitation on the result text, subtitling a movie have to be done within a limited number of words. This is because a subtitle should not be too long to the point that it will cover the whole screen. Another aspect that should be considered is the amount of time that the audience have or need to be able to read the subtitle before the scene changed. There are scenes with a long dialogue but only a little time to read the subtitle. Thus, the translator will have to carefully consider the time frame. In some cases, indirect translation is needed to cut off words and fit the time frame.

Although language is no longer a problem, translating a movie from the source language to the target language is still a complicated process. Language is one of the most important things in the life of every human being. Each of them is of course inseparable from language (Purba, 2020). As each country's characteristics are unique and mostly unheard in another region, translating it might be a little bit tricky as it can result in the meaning alteration or upsetting grammatical and stylistic elements of the target language when translated directly. The target of the audience should also be considered due to a different level of understanding and situation in their country. According to Aji, Gunawan, and Simatupang (2020), the choice of method in translating should be accompanied by consideration regarding the target of the audience. Sapir (1949:69) also stated, two languages will never sufficiently similar to the point it can represent the same social reality. In this situation, people use oblique translation techniques to deliver the correct information and avoid mistranslation.

Oblique translation is a technique that is applied when translating the text directly is impossible. According to Vinay and Darbelnet as cited in Venuti (2004), in such cases where the direct translation is impossible, more complex process needs to be applied to convey the meaning of the source language (SL). Although the result might look unusual or a bit lacking in some aspects, oblique translation procedures allow the translator to undertake strict control over the reliability of their efforts.

As a distinct translation procedure, oblique is used to fill the gaps identified between TL and the SL. These gaps may be due to differences in the social, cultural, and grammatical aspects of the two languages. The aim of this procedure is to make the overall impression remain the same while still be able to deliver the messages from the SL. As stated by Vinay and Darbelnet, this translation procedure has four techniques, namely transposition, modulation, equivalence, and adaptation.

Transposition is a technique in translation that involves replacing words from one-class by words from another class without changing the meaning of the text. Transposition can also change the grammatical form when translating SL to TL. There are two kinds of

transposition, obligatory and optional. Obligatory happens when the target language system leaves no option for the translator other than replacing the word, while optional transposition is a transposition that is made by choice by the translator, usually for the sake of style. Examples for this technique is shown in the table below.

Example:

Source Language (SL)  
Firm friends  
Target Language (TL)  
Sahabat baik

Modulation means making another variation of message by changing the point of view. Like transposition, there are two types of modulation: optional modulation and obligatory modulation. Optional modulation is used without any linguistic reason. It is used to find the more natural form in the TL. Obligatory modulation occurs when a word or sentence cannot be found in the TL.

Example:

Source Language (SL)  
I'm going to kill you myself  
Target Language (SL)  
Aku akan menghabisimu

Equivalence in oblique translation is a technique that is used to describe a situation presented in one language using a different style or structural method in another language. This process requires translating one language to another language with an emphasis on finding words, or equivalence, with the closest natural meaning in the target language.

Example:

Source Language (SL)  
Therefore, I say good day to you!  
Target Language (SL)  
Jadi, selamat siang!

## II. Review of Literature

### 2.1 Adaptation

Vinay and Darbelnet in Venuti describes adaptation as a procedure to create a situation to match the SL situation. Adaptation is used when a culture or situation does not exist in the TL. It allows translator to make a new situation that can be considered equivalent with the one from the SL. Adaptation technique applied after studying the SL and searching for the possibility of similar term on TL. One culture might not be known in another region but in most of the case the culture is adapted resulting on a completely new and different culture. This is a challenge for every translator as they will have to do proper research before deciding how to adapt a term that does not exist in the TL. As Baker and Saldanha (2009) stated, adaptation can be seen as a set of intervention in translation resulting in a text that might not be generally accepted but can represent the idea from the source text.

Example:

Source Language (SL)  
Lords  
Target Language (SL)  
Bangsawan

Due to its nature, subtitle will need a lot of adaptations in its translation process as most movies carry their own cultural and social norms that may not be the same as those in the place where the target language is used. Thus, this study focuses on adaptation as one of the approaches in oblique translation in subtitling.

Adaptation is used when a culture or situation does not exist in the TL. It allows translator to make a new situation that can be considered equivalent with the one from the SL. Adaptation technique applied after studying the SL and searching for the possibility of similar term on TL. One culture might not be known in another region but in most of the case the culture is adapted resulting on a completely new and different culture. This is a challenge for every translator as they will have to do proper research before deciding how to adapt a term that does not exist in the TL. As Volf, P (2020) stated that “adaptation is a translation technique that replaces elements of the source language with elements that are accepted and recognized in the target language.” In addition, Molina and Albir (2002) described adaptation as the shift in cultural environment by expressing a message by using a different situation. Khazrouni (2017) defined adaptation as changing translations in order to suits the reader and situation. Based on the previous materials, it can be concluded that adaptation is a translation technique that includes cultural shift in order to express the SL messages by following suit of the TL audience and situation.

There are various reasons as of why adaptation is applied. Ngongeh and Awung (2018) pointed five reasons of applying adaptation: 1) target audience requirements, 2) expanding literary repertoire, 3) adapting literary norms to target country, 4) adapting visual into text for disabled audience, and 5) when two languages have a very different structure and grammar. In addition, Baker and Saldanha (2009) pointed the most common condition which leads the translator to resort to adaptation are: cross-code breakdown, situational or cultural inadequacy, genre switching, and disruption of the communication process. These conditions might lead to two major types of adaptation, local and global. Local adaptation is an adaptation caused by problems from original text. Meanwhile, global adaptation id determined by a wider revision from factors outside the original text.

Baker and Saldanha (2009) are also categorized the modes used in adaptation into transcription of the original, omission, expansion, exoticism, updating, situational or cultural adequacy, and creation.

## **2.2 Transcription of the Original**

Transcription of the original is usually accompanied by literal translation by word of word.

Example:

Source Language (SL)

My finder's fee

Target Language (TL)

Uang imbalanku

## **2.3 Omission**

Omission is eliminating or implicating some part of the text.

Source Language (SL)

You are my ward!

Target Language (TL)

Kau tanggung jawabku!

## **2.4 Expansion**

Expansion is adding an explication to the information.

Example:

Source Language (SL)

You are here to be made into young ladies

Target Language (TL)

Kalian disini untuk dididik menjadi wanita berkelas

## 2.5 Exoticism

Exoticism is a procedure of making a substitution for slang, dialect, nonsense words, etc. It is done by using a rough equivalent in the target language.

Example:

Source Language (SL)

Following your breadcrumb trail

Target Language (TL)

Mengikuti jejak yang kau buat

## 2.6 Updating

Updating is replacing information with the modern equivalents.

Example:

Source Language (SL)

I was just to take my seat in the House of Lords

Target Language (SL)

Aku akan menjadi Dewan Bangsawan

## 2.7 Situational or Cultural Adequacy

Situational or cultural adequacy means recreating a culturally appropriate context that is more familiar for the audience compared to the original context.

Example:

Source Language (SL)

Queen's Anne Lace

Target Language (TL)

Wortel liar

## 2.8 Creation

Creation is a replacement by taking the ideas or messages using the global equivalent.

Example:

Source Language (SL)

Powder puff

Target Language (TL)

Bantal

This study aimed to identify what kind of words, sentences, and phrases are adapted using modes in Indonesian subtitle of Enola Holmes (2020) movie. In addition, this study will also identify the differences between the adapted form with the source language.

### III. Research Method

The subject of this study is the Indonesian subtitle of Enola Holmes (2020) movie as broadcasted on Netflix. This study is a qualitative descriptive comparative study on Enola Holmes (2020) Indonesian subtitles. Qualitative research consists of collecting and analyzing non-numerical data such as text, video, and audio. As cited on Baihaqi (2018), Krippendorff stated that a method in a qualitative approach of content analysis that provides new insight, increases a researcher's understanding of phenomena, or inform practical actions. Nazir (2005:58) suggested that a comparative study is descriptive research with the aims of answering ground question by cause-and-effect analysis, analyzing factors causing a specific phenomenon.

In this paper, the researcher will be focusing on adaptation technique used on the Indonesian subtitle of the movie Enola Holmes (2020) directed by Harry Bradbeer from Netflix. The movie is about Sherlock's younger sister who travels through London hoping to find her missing mother. The movie set in the year 1884, which is on late 19th century.

The researcher chooses this topic as they are interested on whether there is an adaptation technique applied on the subtitle or not and what is the difference between the result and the source language shown in the movie sets in the late 19th century of London into subtitle that can be understood by Indonesian audience. The researcher hopes that this research will help teachers or students who study translation to understand more about adaptation technique.

Data collection was performed in the following steps: watch, collect relevant data, categorize, analysis. First, the researcher watched the broadcasted movie on Netflix. Second, the researched collected the transcription of the movie and wrote down the Indonesian subtitle the marked all the adaptation applied on the subtitle. Third, categorized the data based on adaptation techniques applied. Lastly, analyzing the adaptation techniques to see the differences between the SL and TL.

### IV. Results and Discussion

After a thorough analysis, the following report provided result of the analysis on sentences and words with applied adaptation techniques from Indonesian subtitle of Enola Holmes (2020) movie.

**Table 1.** Adaptation Techniques Applied on Indonesian Subtitles of Enola Holmes (2020) Movie

No.	Adaptation Strategy	Frequency
1	Transcription of Original	14
2	Omission	4
3	Expansion	2
4	Exoticism	14
5	Updating	5
6	Situational or Cultural Adequacy	11
7	Creation	1

To explain the details and the difference between the utterance and the subtitles of Enola Holmes (2020) movie, several examples from the data identified in the movie are presented below.



#### 4.1 Transcription of Original

Datum 1

SL: Waist 24 inches

TL: *Pinggang 61 sentimeter*

(Timestamp: 00:12:41 – 00:12:42)

Datum 1 is classified as transcription of the original mode as it is translated word-by-word. The adaptation applied is the change of the number and the unit of measure. The reason why the inch needs to be adapted into centimeter is because inch as a unit of measure is rarely used in Indonesia. The translator calculated the original size in inches and convert it into centimeter. The difference in the translation is only the unit of measurement used; the size is still same.

#### 4.2 Omission

Datum 2:

SL: Viscount Irritation, Marquess of Bothersomeshire

TL: *Viscount menyebalkan dari Antah Berantah*

(Timestamp: 01:14:37 – 01:14:40)

Omission mode is used by cutting off the word ‘Marquess’ when translating the sentence above. There are two titles in the sentence, viscount and marquess, that can lead to confusion for people who are not familiar with the nobility titles in England. To avoid the confusion, the translator decided to remove ‘marquess’ and left only the title of viscount. It is because Tewkesbury, who is the main character of the movie referred to in this utterance, was still a viscount at the time of this utterance, even though he can be considered as marquess because he is the only heir of Basilwether, meaning that he will be a marquess when his father died. The subtitle did not show the fact that Tewkesbury is a soon to be marquess. Thus, this information is omitted in the subtitle.

In addition, the word ‘Bothersomeshire’ can be considered as Exoticism because it is a nonsense word based on Tewkesbury’s family name, Basilwether. The word itself came up from three other words: ‘bother’, ‘shome’, and ‘shire’. Bother means a person who caused an annoyance, shome means shame, and shire means a rural area. In conclusion, it is possible to have more than one mode in one sentence.

#### 4.3 Expansion

Datum 3

SL: Sherry, please

TL: *Anggur Sherry*

(Timestamp: 00:36:45 – 00:36:46)

Wine is not a famous drink in Indonesia, considering that the majority of the people living in this country are Muslims. The translator used expansion mode by adding ‘*anggur*’ to tell the audience that Sherry is a name of a wine. The addition made the definition of word ‘sherry’ becomes clear for the audience.

#### 4.4 Exoticism

Datum 4

SL: Is that why you’re here, to pick my brains?

TL: *Itu alasanmu kemari, untuk menguji otakku?*

(Timestamp: 01:24:47 – 01:24:48)

Exoticism mode is applied on the sentence above. It is used to translate ‘to pick my brain’ as it was an idiom. The meaning of this idiom, according to the definition in

Merriam Webster's dictionary, is to gain information or advice from someone. It is not common to use the idiom to a stranger or to someone you are not close to as it is considered offensive. When using the idiom to a stranger it can be assumed that the speaker only needs the listener's brain, not the person itself.

Enola and Sherlock are not close as they have not met for years. That is why Enola got offended and thought that Sherlock only trying to pick on her brain. The translator then translated the idiom into "*menguji otakku*" to represent how Enola is offended by the behavior of Sherlock.

#### 4.5 Updating

Datum 5

SL: I didn't want to go to Miss Harrison's Finishing School for Young Ladies

TL: *Aku tak mau sekolah di Dekolah Kepribadian Putri Nona Harisson*

(Timestamp: 00:32:47 – 00:32:51)

Finishing school is a place for the young ladies to prepare themselves to enter the society. The education includes social grades and upper-class culture. Nowadays, the etiquettes and manners can be learned from charm school. The sentence then translated with the updating mode by using the translation of charm school instead of finishing school.

The difference is the charm school can be attended by any gender and the lessons are targeted for formal occasion while the finishing school is only for the young ladies.

#### 4.6 Situational or Cultural Adequacy

Datum 6

SL: *Agaricus lanipes*

TL: *Cantharellus cibarius*

(Timestamp: 00:31:27 – 00:31:28)

Datum 7

SL: The princess

TL: Chantarelle

(Timestamp: 00:31:29 – 00:31:30)

The two data above shown a completely different species of mushrooms. But both mushrooms are not common in Indonesia, they are mostly found in UK (species.nbnatlas.org). The reason it was translated as a different species is because the one that Viscount Tewkesbury gave to Enola is *Cantharellus cibarius* or Chantarelle. The shape is different from *Agaricus lanipes* or the princess. The translator adapted the translation using situational adequacy mode where they translate according to the scene rather than the utterance.

These data shows that the subtitler is very observant with what is happening in the scene. However, since the subtitle should be a translation of the utterance, the difference in the name of species mentioned between the utterance and the subtitle might confuse the audience. It can be argued that what this subtitle might be considered as an over-adaptation. Nevertheless, more research should be done to support this argument, such as by consultation with the subtitler.



#### 4.7 Creation

Datum 8

SL: Why are you dressed like a powder puff?

TL: *Kenapa pakaianmu seperti bantal?*

(Timestamp: 00:42:51 – 00:42:53)

Creation mode is applied in the translation process above. The powder puff in 19<sup>th</sup> century is thick and wide, which is similar to Enola clothes. She wears a thick layer of gown and a hip regulator that makes her clothes looks puffy. By applying creation mode, the translator grasps the puffy concept and translates it into the more global word, *bantal* or pillow. It has a completely different appearance, but they do have a similar concept. It is because powder puff in Indonesia is thin and not as big as the one from England in 19<sup>th</sup> century

### V. Conclusion

Based on the findings in this study, there are seven adaptation modes used in the subtitling of Enola (2020) movie, based on the classification of adaptation modes of Saldanha and Baker used in this study. A total of 51 data on the application of adaptation in the movie's subtitle were collected, which were then categorized based on the mode of adaptation used in the translation. This categorization demonstrates that the Transcription of Original mode is used 14 times while the Omission is used 4 times, Expansion 2 times, and Exoticism 14 times. In addition, the Updating, Situational or Cultural Adequacy, and Creation modes are used 5 times, 11 times, and 1 time, respectively. From the data, it can be seen that Transcription of the Original and Exoticism is not used modes in the subtitle.

It can be concluded that to be able to use the appropriate adaptation mode in translating utterances in a movie into subtitle, the subtitler has to do a thorough study on both languages and cultures and put his or her focus not only on the utterance but also the scene to be able to grasp the meaning that the characters want to convey. A good application of adaptation modes will result on good understanding of the movie among audience, who will be able to understand the meaning and feel the nuance of the movie. Good subtitle will bridge the gap between different languages, time sets, and cultures. Therefore, it is advisable that adaptation should be applied when translating utterances in a movie into subtitle.

### References

- Aji, H. W. P., Gunawan, H., Simatupang, E. CM., (2020). Analysis of Translation Used in Translating Usage Instruction of Beauty Products. English Journal Literacy Utama, <https://doi.org/10.33197/ej lutka.vol4.iss2.2020.2655.4585>
- Baihaqi, A. (2018). Source Language Versus Target Language Translation Procedures. Pandeglang: Journal of English Language Teaching and Literature (JELTL).
- Bagheri, M. and Nemati, A. (2014). On the Translation Strategies of Movie Dubbing and Subtitling: A Frequency Analysis on Explication in Translation. Iran: Horizon Research Publishing. DOI: 10.13189/lls.2014.020303
- Baker, M. and Saldanha, G. (2009). Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies. New York: Routledge.
- Catford, J. C. (1965). A linguistic theory of translation. London: Oxford University Press.
- Fitria, T.N. (2014). Translation Technique of English to Indonesian Subtitle in Doraemon "Stand by Me" Movie. Surakarta: Muhammadiyah University.

- Herman, Juniyati Rajagukguk. (2019). An English Oblique Translation Analysis of "Twitter" Social Networking Website into Indonesian: An Applied Linguistics Study. *International and Public Affairs*. Vol. 3, No. 1, 2019, pp. 6-12. doi: 10.11648/j.ipa.20190301.12
- Khazuoni, M. (2017). Adaptation in Translation: Howell's Short Story 'Christmas Every Day'. *Arab World English Journal for Translation & Liberty Studies*, 1(3). doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.24093/awejtls/vol1no3.15>
- Krippendorff, K. Content Analysis. California: Sage Publication, Inc., 2004.
- Molina, L, Albir, A.H. (2002). "Translation Techniques Revisited: A Dynamic and Functionalist Approach." *Les Presses de l'Université de Montréal, Journal des traducteurs*, 47, no. 4. [id.erudit.org/iderudit/008033ar](http://id.erudit.org/iderudit/008033ar)  
<https://doi.org/10.7202/008033ar>
- Nazir. 2005. Metode Penelitian. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Ngongeh, M, M. and Awung, F. (2018). A Reflexion on the Murky Difference between Adaptation and Translation. Online. <https://translationjournal.net>, accessed on May 29th, 2022.
- Purba, N. et al. (2020). Language Acquisition of Children Age 4-5 Years Old in TK Dhinukum Zholtan Deli Serdang. *Linglit Journal: Scientific Journal of Linguistics and Literature*. P.19-24
- Sapir, Edward. (1949). Culture, Language And Personality: Selected Essays. USA: University of California, Ltd.
- Venuti, Lawrence (Ed). (2004). The Translation Studies Reader: Second Edition. New York: Routledge.
- Volf, P. (2020). Translation techniques as a method for describing the results and classifying the types of translation solutions. *Applied Translation*, 14(2), 1–7. <https://doi.org/10.51708/apptrans.v14n2.1171>