

Collaborative Governance of Vocational Middle School Education Planning to Meet the Needs of the Business and Industry World in Banten Province

Nyoto Suwignyo¹, Muchlis Hamdi², Hadi Prabowo³, Sampara Lukman⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri

nyoto1028@gmail.com

Abstract

The implementation of development in Indonesia is directed at achieving the ideals of the State of Indonesia to become a sovereign, advanced, just and prosperous country. One of the efforts to achieve this is through the implementation of education which is the responsibility of the Central Government and the Provincial/Regency/City Governments, where the Provincial Government has the authority to administer General High School and Vocational High School Education. The Banten Provincial Government in supporting the implementation of education, especially vocational education, is carried out through Vocational Revitalization in order to meet the needs of the Business and Industrial World (DUDI) which require collaborative governance planning. This study aims to analyze collaborative governance of vocational education planning in Banten Province and develop collaborative governance strategies for vocational education planning in Banten Province. This research focuses on collaborative governance that occurs in every stage of education planning for Vocational High Schools (SMK) in Banten Province in 2020-2021. Collaborative governance of Vocational Education planning in Banten Province is carried out using a qualitative approach with descriptive analysis methods. Data obtained through documentation, interviews and observations. The researcher analyzes collaborative governance that is contained in each stage of planning for Vocational High Schools in Banten province by using indicators of facilitative leadership, institutional designs, which will encourage a collaborative process in education planning for Banten Province Vocational High Schools. at each planning stage which consists of five stages, namely develop the plan, translate the plan, plan operations, execute the plan, as well as monitor and learn and analyze the involvement of actors in each stage of planning for Vocational High Schools in Banten Province. The results of the analysis show that collaborative management of vocational education planning in Banten Province is not optimal, where the role of actors is still partial and planning and budgeting from CSR funds or other funding sources have not been included in regional planning documents.

Keywords

Collaborative Governance;
Vocational Education Planning;
Revitalization of Vocational
High Schools



I. Introduction

The implementation of decentralized regional government is a manifestation of bringing government services closer to the community, as well as providing regional flexibility to regulate and manage the affairs under their authority in accordance with the characteristics of the region and its people. The regulation and management of public services can be carried out by local governments or quasi-between local governments and the community which must be carried out optimally so that they can serve the needs and activities of the community. The Government of Indonesia through the National

Development Planning Agency, has formulated a vision of Indonesia in 2045 to become a sovereign, advanced, just and prosperous country through 4 (four) main pillars of development which include: (1) development of Human Resources (HR) and mastery of Science and Technology (science and technology); (2) sustainable economic development; (3) equitable development; and (4) national resilience and governance.

The implementation of education affairs which are the authority of the province, one of which is the implementation of vocational education. In order to realize the goal of implementing a national education system in order to ensure the improvement of the quality and relevance of education management to face challenges in accordance with the demands of changes in local, national and global life, the government has set Presidential Instruction No. 9 of 2016 concerning Revitalization of Vocational High Schools (SMK). This policy intends to provide a reference for the central government and local governments to build perceptions, draft regulations, prepare forums, prepare documents, carry out evaluations and provide incentives and punishments in the development of vocational education, especially with regard to governance of inter-sectoral collaboration to support the fulfillment of the workforce in accordance with the needs of the Business World and the Industrial World (DUDI).

Community participation in development planning is an urgency because it creates a good governance. In order to accommodate the interaction between stakeholders in development planning, especially vocational education planning, a collaborative governance concept approach is needed. The interaction between stakeholders will be able to improve school performance and develop the education system, as well as the many actors involved in the quasi-organization of educational affairs causing complexity in its management starting from planning, implementation, control and evaluation. This is in accordance with the statement (Newman, 2004) that:

"Complex problems typically warrant a network response because (i) these problems are highly adaptive or 'wicked', (ii) the resources, knowledge and solutions are distributed across a large number of organizations/sectors that necessitates collaboration among these organizations to address these problems and (3) a potential lack of interest for collaboration as the result of, among others, neglecting to take into account mutual benefit to all engaged sectors".

The development of Vocational Education in Banten, since 2020 has led to strengthening cooperation with the Business and Industrial World (DUDI). Strengthening cooperation with DUDI is a strategy to increase the uptake of vocational graduates in the world of work. The direction of the Banten Province education policy for 2017-2022 has not specifically discussed vocational education related to the vocational revitalization policy.

The direction of policies and programs as well as the annual activity work plan carried out by the Banten Provincial Education Office is still partial and does not fully support the vocational revitalization policy. The collaborative scheme in the planning of Vocational Education in Banten Province has not proportionally involved related actors at every stage of the development planning of Vocational Education in Banten Province, starting from the determination of the vision and mission, regional development goals that contain medium-term education policy targets, translation of medium-term policies into regional strategic plans, operationalization of plans in the annual work plan document, budget execution according to work plans and reports on the results of the implementation of education in order to meet the needs of DUDI. Preliminary research shows that vocational education planning in Banten Province has not implemented structured

collaborative governance in collaboration. Not all SMKs are able to collaborate with DUDI, which is shown by the limited MoU and assistance to academics and DUDI.

Increasing stakeholder participation in development planning is one of the efforts to achieve the principles of good governance (Petr Klusáček et. al, 2018, 29-39). The instrument for realizing this can be achieved through a collaborative governance concept approach (Ansell & Gash, 2008). Through a collaborative governance concept approach, all stakeholders (citizens both individually and in community groups) can be involved in public forums and the decision-making process is based on consensus. This concept is empirically proven that inter-institutional collaboration is able to improve school performance and develop the education system (Palleta, 2012).

Collaborative governance can be defined as an arrangement in which one or more public institutions directly involve stakeholders outside the government in a formal collective decision-making process, oriented to consensus and deliberation and aimed at making or implementing public policies and program management or public assets (Ansell and Gash, 2008). Collaborative governance can include partnerships between government, the private sector, civil society and so on. In collaborative governance, various actors from the public, private, and community sectors come together to achieve various public goals, including policy formulation, policy implementation, or coordinating public service tasks (Emerson, Nabatchi, & Balogh, 2012).

In the collaborative process box, Ansell and Gash (2008) view the collaborative process as an iterative cycle. This collaboration process cycle has important components or stages, namely: (1) face-to-face dialogue where mutual agreement is required, (2) trust-building, (3) commitment development (commitment to process) and (4) shared understanding which then (5) produces the expected collaboration results (intermediate outcomes). In the model developed by Ansell and Gash (2008), which emphasizes formal cooperation where government stakeholders are the parties that initiate collaboration. The government's role is very important in maintaining the ongoing collaboration process.

Collaboration governance is more difficult to understand because collaboration is often formed without a legal basis or responsibilities and partners that can change. Collaboration in the public is very dynamic because they have to face a complex and constantly changing policy environment. Therefore, collaborative governance structures tend to be flexible in order to adapt to internal and external drivers, as well as the efforts of collaborating parties to manage conflicts (Cornforth, Hayes, & Vangen, 2015).

The results of the literature review related to collaborative governance above, the Ansell & Gash (2008) model was chosen by the researchers as an analytical tool in describing the conditions of collaborative governance. The model is considered relevant because it is able to analyze variables such as facilitative leadership, institutional design, and starting conditions that focus on the collaborative process in implementing the development planning of government affairs in the field of vocational education. The expected results will later become the basis for researchers to develop collaborative governance models in planning the development of government affairs in the field of Vocational High School (SMK) education in Banten Province.

II. Research Method

This study aims to analyze collaborative governance in planning the development of education affairs for Vocational High Schools in Banten Province in meeting the needs of DUDI in Banten Province. Therefore, in line with the research objectives, the approach used is qualitative with analytical descriptive method. According to Yin (2015), qualitative

research can increase researchers' awareness of choosing a belief system as a motivating force to define and conduct research.

Afrizal (2015: 26) suggests that there are 3 (three) theoretical assumptions of researchers in the basis of doing qualitative research methods, namely the first is that social reality is a belief in subjective and inter-subjective reality. Second, social reality is also a reality that is understood by humans, it is even emphasized that researchers also have a role in building social reality in their research situations. The third is because qualitative research is an understanding of social reality and human actions. Furthermore, Lofland (in Mulyana, 2003) suggests that qualitative research has characteristics or more clearly that research is characterized by the types/forms of questions asked, namely: what is going on here? What is the form of the phenomenon to be studied? and what variations are found in this phenomenon? then answer these questions in detail.

III. Result and Discussion

Education is a mandatory government affair for basic services which has been regulated in Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. Education has a very strategic role in contributing to the realization of skilled and ready-to-work human resources or workforce. According to several studies and research, human resources are the main and important factor in the implementation of regional development.

One of the regions in Indonesia that requires skilled and competent human resources is Banten Province. Banten Province is an industrial area that requires a lot of human resources who are ready to work. However, the data shows that Banten Province has a high open unemployment rate based on the highest level of education completed in Banten Province in 2016-2020. The data shows that the contribution of SMK graduates to the open unemployment rate in Banten Province for the last four years is the largest number compared to other graduates, namely 13.14% in August 2016 which then increased to 18.28% in August 2020 or experienced an increase. by 5.14%. According to the Governor of Banten Province, Wahidin Halim (in Kompas, 2021), this condition is caused by the large number of vocational graduates at Vocational High Schools (SMK) that are currently no longer suitable for the industrial world.

This condition indicates that there is a need for contributions from various other stakeholders outside the government in implementing the planning and development of SMK in Banten Province which is described in five stages of planning by Daft (2014), starting from the stage of develop the plan, translate the plan, plan operations, execute the plan, as well as monitor and learn. The involvement of other stakeholders in the planning of vocational education can be done with collaboration that requires interaction and coordination in the quasi-organization of vocational education affairs in Banten Province. Interaction between stakeholders and the existence of community participation in development planning is one of the important efforts to achieve the principles of good governance (Klusáček et. al, 2018, 29-39) involving actors such as the government, the private sector and the community. The interaction of these actors requires an instrument known as the concept of collaborative governance (Ansell & Gash, 2008). Through this concept, all stakeholders (citizens both individually and in community groups) can be involved in public forums to the decision-making process based on consensus.

3.1 Develop the Plan for Vocational Education

A series of stages in a plan begins with developing a comprehensive plan by clearly defining the vision and mission and setting common goals. Goal setting is very important

where planning is needed to achieve these goals and map out resource requirements, timeline of actions and activities and main tasks that must be carried out. At the stage of defining the vision and mission and setting the goals of vocational education in Banten Province, a strong leadership role is needed, institutional design and collaborative processes are needed so that the vision, mission and goals can accommodate all stakeholder interests.

3.2 Leadership at the Develop the Plan Stage

Facilitative leadership looks at the presence of a leader who initiates a collaborative process and secures resources to support collaborative governance. There are two roles in leadership according to Crosby & Bryson (2005): (1) sponsors, namely someone who has the authority, authority and access to the resources used in collaboration, and (2) champions, namely someone who focuses on keeping the collaboration going and uses his expertise to help collaborative process to achieve common goals. Looking at the leadership role proposed by Crosby & Bryson (2005), the collaborative process in planning the vocational education sector in Banten Province can be seen from how the Governor of Banten Province became the initiator in improving the quality of vocational education in Banten Province.

Vocational education planning has been stated in the Banten Province Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMD) document for 2017-2022. One of the missions of the Governor of Banten Province is to increase access and equal distribution of quality education services, including vocational education. In the changes to the Banten Province RPJMD for 2017-2022 (Perda No. 10 of 2019) there are Banten Province efforts to sharpen targets in strengthening Vocational Schools, especially in supporting the target of absorption of Vocational High School graduates in the business and industrial world with the performance indicator "Percentage of Vocational Graduates absorbed in Job Market". In addition, in the planning document there is also a performance indicator "Percentage of Vocational High Schools that apply link and match" where the link and match policy was developed by the government to increase the relevance of Vocational High School (SMK) graduates to the needs of the world of work and industry (DUDI). The existence of two performance indicators related to vocational secondary education related to the absorption of vocational workers and the link and match policy is expected to encourage the achievement of the Governor's vision and mission.

Link and match Vocational and DUDI education in Banten Province in its implementation is not limited to the implementation of the transfer of information and technology used and needed by the industrial world or companies to vocational education institutions, but also needs to prepare graduates who have the ability to communicate, interact, think, work quickly and can be invited to work together or in a group. There are still many SMK graduates who have not been absorbed in the world of work and not all SMKs have implemented link and match in Banten Province, indicating that leadership initiatives have not been followed up in the operationalization of plans at the technical level.

3.3 Institutional Design at the Stage of Develop

A good and successful collaboration needs to involve various stakeholders who are related and/or affected by the management of the vocational education sector in Banten Province. Clear arrangements are needed to maintain the involvement and active participation of various stakeholders to discuss issues or policies which then reach a common consensus. According to Ansell and Gash (2008) there are several indicators of

institutional design in the plan development stage such as inclusive participation, exclusivity of the forum, the existence of clear arrangements, and transparency in the collaboration process.

The formulation of the vision and mission as well as the setting of goals in collaborative governance of vocational education in Banten Province has been stated in the regional medium-term planning document (RPJMD) which was initiated by the Governor of Banten Province and can be accessed by the community and other stakeholders. In addition to the Regional Regulation on the RPJMD that accommodates vocational education in Banten Province, President Joko Widodo has also issued Presidential Instruction (Inpres) Number 9 of 2016 concerning the Revitalization of Vocational High Schools (SMK) which aims to improve the quality and competitiveness of Human Resources (HR).) Indonesia. Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2016 was issued to strengthen the synergy between stakeholders in revitalizing SMK in improving the quality and competitiveness of Indonesian human resources. Vocational revitalization is carried out not only from physical development or infrastructure, but is carried out by managing and renewing SMK from within such as institutional strengthening and cooperation, curriculum development, and increasing the competence of educators and SMK graduates.

The Governor's six tasks in accordance with Presidential Instruction 9 of 2016 concerning Vocational Revitalization include: (1) making a roadmap for vocational development; (2) perfecting and aligning the SMK curriculum with competencies according to the needs of graduate users (link and match); (3) increase the number and competence of educators and vocational education personnel; (4) increase cooperation with Ministries/Agencies, Regional Governments, and the business/industry world; (5) increasing access to SMK graduate certification and SMK accreditation; and (6) forming a Vocational School Development Working Group. Based on Presidential Instruction Number 9 of 2016 concerning Revitalization of Vocational High Schools (SMK), the Banten Provincial Government also needs to manage the education sector by revitalizing Vocational Schools.

Even though the Presidential Instruction Number 6 of 2019, the Banten Provincial Government's incentives in planning for vocational education, especially vocational revitalization, have not been seen optimally. The Banten Provincial Government is still in the stage of compiling a roadmap or roadmap for vocational revitalization, even though Presidential Instruction 9 of 2016 has been issued which mandates local governments to compile one of the roadmaps or roadmaps for the revitalization of vocational education where the roadmap can be a guide in institutional implementation, curriculum, and collaboration with industry that will lead to collaboration between stakeholders. The existence of a roadmap for the revitalization of vocational schools is intended to facilitate local governments in planning and managing vocational schools, one of which is mapping collaboration and cooperation with the business world and industry (DUDI) with vocational education. This is in line with the statement by the Banten Provincial Education Office as follows:

"It is true that we have not compiled a roadmap for the revitalization of SMK, which should ideally be compiled in 2017/2018 so that it can be a guide in planning the vocational education sector and link and match cooperation between stakeholders such as with the business world and the industrial world (DUDI) in Banten Province. So far, our basis or reference in revitalizing SMK is to look at existing problems such as the Open Unemployment Rate (TPT), the absorption of SMK graduates in the industrial world, problem data from SMK and planning documents such as the RPJMD" Bante Provincial Education

The preparation of the roadmap which should be the basis for the Banten provincial government's guidelines in revitalizing SMK for the next few years has not been carried out due to the lack of readiness or readiness of the Banten provincial government in compiling the document. The roadmap document for the revitalization of vocational schools can accelerate the development of vocational schools in Banten province by including arrangements related to institutions, cooperation and strategies in developing vocational schools. This was acknowledged in an interview conducted on 11 December 2021 as follows:

"The obstacle faced in compiling a roadmap for the revitalization of SMK is actually more about the readiness or readiness of our human resources (Banten Province Education and Culture Office) which is still lacking and not optimal in its preparation because of the many other activities outside of the SMK revitalization which are busy so that it does not work. can focus on the preparation of the roadmap. It is unfortunate that the important documents that are the main or guideline in the planning of Vocational High Schools have not yet been compiled. However, it does not mean that activities for the revitalization of SMK are not carried out. We are still focused on aligning the curriculum of vocational schools with the industrial world" (Banten Provincial Education Office).

Banten Province does not yet have a roadmap or roadmap, the government's contribution in planning collaboration in the vocational education sector is still carried out by inviting the business world and the industrial world to jointly revitalize SMK and improve the quality of SMK by developing curriculum and competence of SMK students to suit the needs of DUDI. The curriculum is one of the most strategic components of education because it is a set of plans and arrangements regarding the objectives, content, and learning materials as well as the methods used as guidelines for the implementation of learning activities to achieve certain educational goals. (Tamami, 2016).

In general, SMK in Banten Province uses or adds to a special curriculum developed by the school itself. The government, in this case the Education and Culture Office of Banten Province, mandates Vocational Schools to establish partnerships with the industrial world or companies in compiling and aligning the supported Vocational School curriculum to suit the needs of the industry or company. The following are the results of a survey related to curriculum development carried out by Vocational Schools where there are four things that Vocational Schools do in curriculum development, namely: (1) developing curriculum, (2) in the curriculum development process, (3) not developing curriculum, (4) only follow the national curriculum.

3.4 Collaborative Process at the Stage of Develop the Plan

The vision and mission of the Governor of Banten for the 2017-2022 period was formulated based on the regional development priorities of the Banten province during 2005-2025 or the policy direction of the RPJPD (the results of the interview with the Head of Bappeda on 10 December 2021). The process of formulating the vision and mission is not prepared individually but carried out in a coalition. The Governor and Deputy Governor elected team discussed with the Bappeda Technocratic Planning Document Preparation Team by presenting Experts (academics) as resource persons (the results of the interview with the Head of PPA Bappeda 10 December 2021), which stated that:

"The formulation of the vision and mission has been previously carried out by regional head candidates before participating in the election. However, the General Elections Commission has provided a reference in formulating the vision and mission. Legislation is still a guideline in formulating the vision and mission, then the vision and mission will be set to be used as campaign material in the Regional Head Election event.

However, if they have been elected as regional heads, the Success Team and from the Regional Development Planning Agency will follow up on the vision and mission to be stipulated by Regional Regulations and serve as guidelines in the administration of regional government for five years”.

Banten province's education policy for the years 2005-2025 is to increase access to quality and affordable education services and increase the application of science and technology-oriented education that is oriented to the needs of the business world. Through the vision of "Banten Forward, Independent, Competitive, Prosperous and Has Good Morals". “Advanced” Banten Province means a change for the better through the application of good governance principles and “Independent” means that Banten Province has sufficient regional financial capacity to support and carry out regional development. Banten Province "Competitive" means that the region has the ability to manage and develop regional potential and become an investment destination compared to other regions and "Prosperous" means that Banten Province is able to manage human aspects as measured by the achievement of the human development index. Banten Province which "Berakhlakul Karimah" means regional expectations in emphasizing the behavior of community and government life that reflects the application of religious values.

This statement is supported by the results of an interview (Head of Bappeda) on 12 November 2021 that the direction of Banten province's education policy for 2017-2022 is more on an access-oriented approach to infrastructure development, whereas other approaches must be reoriented towards the curriculum so that link and match with DUDI can be implemented. optimally. Further examination of the planning documents stipulated through the 2019 and 2020 Education Office Work Plan documents still focuses on access development activities, not yet planned for capacity building. This is also confirmed from the results of interviews with several SMK Principals, that:

“In addition, parents still prefer their children to stay at home rather than having to go to school which is very far away which costs money and time. So, at the time of preparing the development plan in the field of Education, the proposals from us and the community were only limited to improving educational facilities and infrastructure.”

In the process of formulating a vision and mission, Daft (2014) states that the vision-mission is a future condition that the organization wants to realize. Therefore, the vision and mission must be clear and compiled in a coalition so that it can be used as a guide in making decisions and actions. Based on field findings, the visions and missions of the regional head of Banten province regarding vocational education have been aligned, clear and compiled taking into account the policy directions of other development plans. However, the implementation is still not optimal because it has not been supported by the direction of education policies that specifically discuss the development of vocational schools. Conditions like this can be improved/changed in policy directions or in programs/activities planned at the time of drafting changes to the RPJMD, beginning with the RPJMD Review by involving stakeholders who play an active role in preparing changes to regional development plans.

IV. Conclusion

Collaborative governance in the planning of vocational education from the facilitative leadership aspect has not been fully optimal because the preparation of medium-term planning documents is still in a transitional condition of transferring the authority of SMK from the Regency/City to the Province where the delivery of personnel, infrastructure, funding and documents (P3D) has not been fully implemented. Besides, the

policy of strengthening vocational education related to revitalization has not been fully accommodated in developing the plan or RPJMD so that it has an impact on the stages of translating the plan, plan operation, execute the plan and monitor and learn.

The commitment to collaborative management of vocational education management in Banten Province has not yet been realized in the roadmap for the revitalization of vocational schools, the availability of regulations, forms of non-institutionalized forums, the provision of incentives and disincentives has not been carried out in an orderly manner and the evaluation has not yet been carried out in a transparent manner involving the role of the community. The clarity of the roles of actors in managing collaborative vocational education planning in Banten Province has not yet been structured in the regulations governing the tasks, functions of each actor and their scheduling. The optimization steps needed for collaborative governance of vocational education planning in Banten Province are as follows: a) Evaluating link and match and preparing an action plan for revitalizing SMK in Banten Province; b) Determination of the scenario planning policy for the development of SMK in the context of meeting the needs of DUDI in Banten Province; c) Increasing the competence of SMK through the development of the SMK curriculum, education and training (training), Field Work Practices (PKL) and mentoring with universities as well as increasing the competence of educators; d) Strengthening the role of the BKK in supporting the revitalization of Vocational High Schools, especially the cooperation between Vocational Schools and DUDI in Banten Province; and e) Optimizing supporting facilities and infrastructure for the development and strengthening of the character of SMK graduates in Banten Province.

References

- Afrizal. (2015). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif: Sebuah Upaya Mendukung Penggunaan Penelitian Kualitatif dalam Berbagai Disiplin Ilmu*. Penerbit PT. RajaGrafindo Persada. Jakarta.
- Agranoff, R., & McGuire, M. (2003). *Collaborative public management: New strategies for local governments*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press.
- Ampry, Evy Segarawati. Penerapan Perencanaan Strategis Dalam Penyusunan Program Pendidikan. *Jurnal Eklektika*, Oktober 2013, Volume 1 Nomor 2
- Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 18(4), 543–571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>.
- Bastian, Indra. (2009). *Sistem Perencanaan dan Penganggaran Pemerintahan Daerah di Indonesia*. Jakarta: Salemba Empat.
- Boon, Kurtz (2008). *Contemporary Marketing* ., New York: Sount-West Cengage Learning.
- Bradford, N. (2016). Ideas and Collaborative Governance: A Discursive Localism Approach. *Urban Affairs Review*, 52(5), 659–684. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1078087415610011>.
- Brinkerhoff DW, Bossert TJ. 2014. Health governance: principal-agent linkages and health system strengthening. *Health Policy and Planning* 29: 685–93.
- Brookfield, Katherine. 2017. “Getting Involved in Plan-Making: Participation in Neighbourhood Planning in England,” *Environment and Planning C: Government and Policy* 35, no. 3: 397–416. Doi: 10.1177/0263774X16664518.
- Bryson, Edwards, Slyke. (2018). Getting strategic about strategic planning research, *Public Management Review*. Hal 321

- Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., & Stone, M. M. (2006). The design and implementation of cross-sector collaborations: Propositions from the literature. *Public Administration Review*, 66(SUPPL. 1), 44–55. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2006.00665.x>
- Bryson, J. M., Crosby, B. C., Stone, M. M., & Saunoi-Sandgren, E. (2012). Dynamics of cross-sector collaboration: Minnesota's urban partnership.
- Bryson, J.M. (2004). *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organizations*, fourth ed. Jossey-Bass, San Francisco, CA.
- Bwimana, A. (2017). Health sector network governance and state-building in south Kivu, Democratic Republic of Congo. *Health policy and planning*, 32(10), 1476-1483.
- Cheng, Y. C., Ng, K. H., & Ching, M. M. (2002). Economic Considerations in Education Policy Making: A simplified framework. *The International Journal of Educational Management*, 16(1), 18-39. Retrieved from <https://search.proquest.com.ezproxy.ugm.ac.id/docview/229147693?accountid=1377>.
- Cornforth, C., Hayes, J. P., & Vangen, S. (2015). Nonprofit–Public Collaborations: Understanding Governance Dynamics. *Nonprofit and Voluntary Sector Quarterly*, 44(4), 775–795. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0899764014532836>
- dan Analisis SWOT di Kalimantan Timur. *Jurnal Pendas Mahakam*. Vol 3 (2). 98-116. Agustus 2018
- Daymon, C., & Holloway, I. (2007). *Metode-metode riset kualitatif dalam public relations dan marketing communications*. Bentang Pustaka.
- Donahue, John D. 2011. *Collaborative Governance: private roles for public goals in turbulent times*. Princeton University Press: United Kingdom.
- Dornbusch, Fischer dan Startz. 2018. *Macroeconomics Thirteenth Edition*. New York: McGraw-Hill Education.
- Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 22(1), 1–29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>
- Espinosa-González, Ana Belén and Normand, Charles. 2019. “Challenges in the Implementation of Primary Health Care Reforms: A Qualitative Analysis of Stakeholders’ Views in Turkey,” *BMJ Open* 9, no. 7: 1–11. Doi: 10.1136/bmjopen-2018-027492
- Gadjong, Agus S.A. (2007). *Pemerintahan Daerah (Kajian Politik dan Hukum)*. Bogor: Gihalia Indonesia.
- Greener, D. S. (2008). *Business Research Methods*. Dr. Sue Greener & Ventus Publishing ApS.
- Hirawan, S.B. 2007. *Desentralisasi Fiskal Sebagai Suatu Upaya Meningkatkan Penyediaan Layanan Publik (Bagi Orang Miskin) di Indonesia*. Jakarta: UI.
- Hoessein Bhenyamin. 2009. *Perubahan Model, Pola, dan Bentuk Pemerintahan Daerah: Dari Era Orde Baru ke Era Reformasi*. Depok: DIA FISIP UI
- Hubbard et.al. 2014. *Macroeconomics Second Edition*. England: Pearson Education Limited.
- Ichsan, I. 2021. *Model Perencanaan Pembangunan Berbasis Elektronik Di Kota Makassar*. (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Hasanuddin Makassar). Diakses melalui <http://repository.unhas.ac.id/id/eprint/3294/>.
- Indiahono, Dwiyanto. 2009. *Kebijakan Publik Berbasis Dynamic Policy Analisis*. Gava Media: Yogyakarta.
- J Newman, “Public Participation and Collaborative Governance,” *Journal of Social Policy* 33, no. 2 (2004): 203–223, https://api.elsevier.com/content/abstract/scopus_id/2042427880.

- Kaplan, R. S., & Norton, D. P. (2008). Mastering the management system. *Harvard business review*, 86(1), 62.
- Kharisma, B. (2014). Good governance sebagai suatu konsep dan mengapa penting dalam sektor publik dan swasta: Suatu pendekatan ekonomi kelembagaan. *Jurnal Buletin Studi Ekonomi*, 19(1), 1-34.
- Klijn E-H, Koppenjan J. 2012. Governance network theory: past, present and future. *Policy and Politics* 40: 587–606.
- Klusáček, Petr. et al. 2018. Good Governance as a Strategic Choice in Brownfield Regeneration: Regional Dynamics from the Czech Republic, *Land Use Policy* 73, no. January (2018): 29–39.
- Koski, C., Siddiki, S., Sadiq, A. A., & Carboni, J. (2018). Representation in collaborative governance: A case study of a food policy council. *The American Review of Public Administration*, 48(4), 359-373.
- Lisdiawati, Tantri. 2018. Analisis Strategi Perencanaan Pembangunan Rencana Kerja Pemerintah Daerah (RKPD) Kota Bandung. (Disertasi Doktoral, Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri).
- Lukiswara, Harendhika 2016. *Jurnal Ilmiah Administrasi Publik (JIAP) Analisis Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Dengan Pendekatan Sistem Lunak* 2, no. 4: 211–220.
- Makmur. (2010). *Efektivitas Kebijakan Kelembagaan Pengawasan*. Bandung: Refika Aditama.
- McGuire, M. (2006). Collaborative public management: Assessing what we know and how we know it. *Public Administration Review*, 66(SUPPL. 1), 33–43. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2006.00664.x>
- Mulyana, Deddy. 2003. *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif (Paradigma baru ilmu komunikasi dan ilmu sosial lainnya)*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Murni dan Somantri. Implementasi Hubungan Sekolah dan Masyarakat di SMP Negeri 10 Kabupaten Lebong (Studi Deskriptif Kualitatif). *Jurnal Manajer Pendidikan* Volume 14 No 3 (Desember 2020).
- Nugroho, Riant. (2012). *Public Policy*, PT Elex Media Komputindo: Jakarta.
- Nyström, M. E. et al. 2018. “Collaborative and Partnership Research for Improvement of Health and Social Services: Researcher’s Experiences from 20 Projects,” *Health Research Policy and Systems* 16, no. 1: 1–17. Doi:10.1186/s12961-018-0322-0.
- O’Leary, R., & Vij, N. (2012). Collaborative Public Management: Where Have We Been and Where Are We Going? *American Review of Public Administration*, 42(5), 507–522. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0275074012445780>
- Paletta, A. 2012. Public Governance and School Performance: Improving Student Learning through Collaborative Public Management, *Public Management Review* 14, no. 8: 1125–1151, https://api.elsevier.com/content/abstract/scopus_id/84869771968
- Parjaman, T. (2018). Kolaborasi Antar Institusi dalam Optimalisasi Program “Banjar Cerdas” Pada Jenjang Pendidikan Menengah Di Kota Banjar. *Dinamika: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 4(4), 533-547.
- Pasaribu, Hasiholan. 2018. Pengaruh Kebijakan Perencanaan Pembangunan Daerah Dan Penganggaran Daerah Dalam Mewujudkan Visi Dan Misi Kepala Daerah Terhadap Kesejahteraan Masyarakat Di Kabupaten Dan Kota Pada Provinsi Banten. (Disertasi Doktoral, Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri).
- Prabowo, H. (2019). Influence of implementation of development and supervision policy to the effectiveness of regional autonomy in Indonesia. *Jurnal Bina Praja: Journal of Home Affairs Governance*, 11(1), 63-73.

- Rezha, Angger Gita. 2021. PPDB Banten Hadapi 7 Masalah, Ombudsman Desak Dinas Pendidikan Lakukan Perbaikan. <https://seputartangsel.pikiran-rakyat.com/nasional/pr-142111442/ppdb-banten-hadapi-7-masalah-ombudsman-desak-dinas-pendidikan-lakukan-perbaikan?page=3>
- Rohani, Amin. 2021. Catatan Pembangunan Pendidikan Di Banten. <https://satubanten.com/catatan-pembangunan-pendidikan-di-banten/>. Diakses pada 24 Agustus 2021.
- Rustiadi, Ernan. 2021. Teori Perencanaan Mazhab dan Praktik Perencanaan Pengembangan Wilayah. Jakarta: Obor.
- Sagala, Syaiful. (2013). Konsep dan Makna Pembelajaran. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Salam, Dharma Setyawan. (2007). Manajemen Pemerintahan Indonesia. Djambatan: Jakarta.
- Setiyono, Budi. (2014). Pemerintahan dan Manajemen Sektor Publik. CAPS: Yogyakarta.
- Simanjuntak, Kardin. 2015. Implementasi Kebijakan Desentralisasi Pemerintahan Di Indonesia,” *Jurnal Bina Praja* 07, no. 02: 111–130. Doi: 10.21787/jbp.07.2015.111-130
- Skinningrud, Tone. 2019. “Vindicating Archer’s Concepts of Educational Systems—Centralized and Decentralized—as Exemplars of Critical Realist Theorizing,” *Journal of Critical Realism* 18, no. 4: 453–473. Doi: 10.1080/14767430.2019.1656924
- Subandi. (2014). Ekonomi Pembangunan. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Subarsono. (2005). Analisis Kebijakan Publik. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar.
- Sugiyono. (2014). Memahami Penelitian Kualitatif. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Suharno. 2010. Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik. Yogyakarta: UNY Press.
- Sutisno.2020. Jadi Penyumbang Terbesar Pengangguran di Provinsi Banten, Pemprov Kaji Jurusan SMK. <https://kabarbanten.pikiran-rakyat.com/seputar-banten/pr-59935279/jadi-penyumbang-terbesar-pengangguran-di-provinsi-banten-pemprov-kaji-jurusan-smk?page=2>
- Suryatama, Erwin. 2014. Lebih Memahami Analisis SWOT Dalam Bisnis Menggunakan Kekuatan Untuk Mengatasi Kelemahan Menggunakan Peluang Untuk Mengatasi Ancaman. Kata Pena.
- Taliziduhu Ndraha. (2005). Kybernologi: Beberapa Konstruksi Utama, Sirao Credntia Center: Tangerang Banten.
- The World Bank. (2008). Independent Evaluation Group. Decentralization in Client Countries –An Evaluation of World Bank Support, 1999-2007.
- Thoha, Miftah. (1995). Perilaku Organisasi Konsep Dasar Dan Aplikasinya, Jakarta: Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Thomson, A. M., & Perry, J. L. (2006). Collaboration Processes: Inside the Black Box. *Public Administration Review*, 66(s1), 20–32.
- Tilaar, H.A.R. dan Nugroho, Riant. (2016). Kebijakan Pendidikan Pengantar Untuk Memenuhi Kebijakan Pendidikan dan Kebijakan Pendidikan sebagai Kebijakan Publik, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.