

Application of Artistic Research Models to Improve the Variety of Research and the Quality of Student's Thesis in the Department of Fine Arts FBS Unimed

Daulat Saragi¹, Osbert Sinaga², Nelson Tarigan³

^{1,2,3}Department of Fine Arts, Faculty of Arts and Languages, Universitas Negeri Medan, Indonesia
saragios@yahoo.co.id

Abstract

This research is motivated by the problem of the model and theme of student thesis research in the fine arts study program so far there has been no novelty. This is evidenced by the thesis that only repeats the theme and object of previous research. The purpose of the research is to apply a research model oriented to textbook products that have an impact on improving the quality and variety of students' thesis research objects. Knowing the effectiveness of the use of teaching materials developed and applied. It is hoped that with this textbook, student thesis research will be varied and touch more on the field of quality art. The research model used with 4D Thiagarajan is define, design, develop, and desiminate. Subjects are students of semester VI totaling 2 classes (32 people) and the object in this study is an art research model. The data collection instrument used was in the form of a questionnaire of students' interest and interest in the applied textbooks. In this study, the quality of research results is measured by the usefulness of the product that has been validated. The results showed that the student's response to the research product reached good and positive criteria. The effectiveness of textbooks developed with various research models is very good. It is recommended that this art research model textbook can be applied by lecturers and students of Fine Arts at FBS Unimed and other universities. In this study, the quality of research results is measured by the usefulness of the product that has been validated. The results showed that the student's response to the research product reached good and positive criteria. The effectiveness of textbooks developed with various research models is very good. It is recommended that this art research model textbook can be applied by lecturers and students of Fine Arts at FBS Unimed and other universities. In this study, the quality of research results is measured by the usefulness of the product that has been validated. The results showed that the student's response to the research product reached good and positive criteria. The effectiveness of textbooks developed with various research models is very good. It is recommended that this art research model textbook can be applied by lecturers and students of Fine Arts at FBS Unimed and other universities.

Keywords

applied; art research model; student's thesis



I. Introduction

This research is based on the results of observations made, it was found that the final project (thesis) of the students of the Department of Fine Arts Education with themes and topics that always repeated. Several students explained that they had not used or owned a

typical art research manual. Lecturers also teach research methods in general without coming into contact with art. In addition to the rarity of art research method books, several lecturers who teach research methodology courses have not yet developed an art research method book. In line with that, students experience confusion in determining the topic of their thesis research so that only 10% of students graduate on time for 8 semesters. In the preliminary interview conducted by the researcher, almost 80% of the seventh semester students had difficulty finding and determining problems in art research.

So far, art students in submitting research titles always repeat previous studies. The research model carried out is also known to only be descriptive qualitative research models and correlation research. The object of research being researched is always repeated, namely the analysis of regional art objects in North Sumatra, and the analysis of student work. Even though there are many research models and objects of art that can be done, including: historical studies, aesthetics, semiotics, cultural engineering, and research and development (R and D) (Sachari, 2004, Sukmadinata, 2014, Sugiyono, 2015).

Every fine arts student is prepared to become a teacher at the junior and senior high school levels. Every teacher will definitely carry out the obligation to research for the acquisition of cumulative grades of promotion or class later. Therefore, each student is guided by a lecturer so that they have the ability to conduct research in accordance with their teaching field, so that later as a teacher they also have the knowledge to conduct research. In line with that, art students should be more familiar with the themes and topics of research in the field of art. For this reason, this research was conducted to develop and apply a book of similarity research methodology in the hope that it will be useful as a guide for conducting thesis research and when they have become teachers.

Student thesis research is actually still related to the role of lecturers to direct and guide from submitting titles to research reports. The main obstacle is the lack of direction and guidance from lecturers starting from the submission of the title. This happens because the supervisor's knowledge is minimal about the research methodology in the field of art. Student thesis supervisors who have never done research have resulted in less opening up of students' horizons to try researching with a different research model from their friends.

To answer the needs of these students, textbooks are needed as a guide in conducting research. This textbook explains various models of art research and art objects that can be used as research objects. This textbook describes the research steps of each research model so that it can explain starting from the data obtained, research instruments to the method of analysis carried out.

The aim of the research is to develop and implement a textbook of art research models consisting of various research models. Validate textbooks on research methods and models of art to experts in the field of research methods. Testing textbooks to students to preparing a draft proposal, and student responses through questionnaires. Broaden students' research horizons and shorten the period of student thesis writing.

The formulation of the problem is, how is the quality of the model textbooks and art research methods developed and applied in terms of their validity and practicality? How is the effectiveness of this model book and art research method in increasing the insight of fine arts students in determining the research topic and research model for their thesis? How are students' responses to this art research method textbook able to open their horizons in determining research topics and speed up the time of writing a thesis.

II. Review of Literatures

Applied research aims to find a solution to a problem that is directly faced by students in writing a thesis. This research is different from fundamental research which is related to generalization and theory formulation. Applied research is a non-systematic investigation that is usually carried out to solve a problem. The results of applied research can be applied to solve practical problems in society, companies and students.

Applied Research (applied research) and Development or Research and Development abbreviated R and D was first introduced by Borg and Gall (1998). Applied research and development is a process or method used to validate and develop products. What is meant by product is an object in the form of textbooks, films for learning, and computer software, but it can also be like educational programs and staff development in an organization (Sugiyono, 2017: 28).

Research and development serves to validate and develop products. Validating the product means that the product already exists, and the researcher only tests the effectiveness or validity of the product. Developing products in a broad sense can be in the form of updating existing products, so that they are more practical and effective and efficient. But it can also create a new product that does not exist so far.

2.1 Research and Development

Research development is divided into 4 levels according to their needs. Level I is research and development where researchers conduct research to determine the potential and problems that exist in an object, conduct research to design products, and conduct research to test the product design internally. In this level of research, researchers do not produce designs that have been made and test these products externally (tested). At level 4 researchers conduct research to create new products and test the effectiveness of the product (Sugiyono, 2017:33). Testing is done by asking for expert or practitioner opinion on the product design. Is the product in accordance with the performance, work system, process to be produced in accordance with market needs.

2.2 Understanding Textbooks

Textbooks are one of the teaching materials, and become one of the learning tools that are arranged systematically and have an important role in the learning process, namely as a reference for lecturers / educators and students to improve learning effectiveness. According to Cahyono (2015:171) and Maulidiana, (2017) teaching materials are information tools and texts used by teachers to study the implementation of learning. In addition, teaching materials are all forms of materials used to assist educators in carrying out learning activities in the classroom. Teaching materials that are selected properly will foster student interest in mastering the material that has been given. Teaching materials will also influence students in a more meaningful teaching and learning process.

According to Hamdani (2011: 120), teaching materials are all forms of materials or materials that are systematically arranged that are used to assist lecturers/teachers or instructors in carrying out teaching and learning activities so as to create an atmosphere that allows students to learn. This shows that teaching materials have a strategic function for the learning process that can help lecturers, teachers and students in learning activities, so that lecturers/teachers do not present too much material. Thus, teaching materials or learning materials consist of knowledge, skills, and attitudes that students must learn in order to achieve the specified competency standards.

Sanjaya (2010:141) defines teaching materials in the form of textbooks as everything that is part of the curriculum content that must be mastered by students with basic

competencies in order to achieve competency standards for each subject in certain educational units. Based on the opinions above, it can be concluded that teaching materials are a set of learning materials (both information, tools, and texts) that are systematically arranged and used in learning. For example, textbooks, textbooks, modules, handouts, dictates, models or mockups, audio teaching materials, interactive teaching materials, and so on.

2.3 Art Research Model

The growing popularity of qualitative research methods in studies involving cultural works and social issues has significantly stimulated the development of methods to examine these phenomena with various approaches. Art students are very open to the possibility of not only researching the learning process, but also leading to the study of cultural symbols, cultural transformation and design development (Ratna, 2010).

Current design developments must be addressed by Fine Arts students in the study of art history and design approaches, aesthetic approaches, semiautoka and others. For this reason, in studies of design research methodologies, alternatives to produce research methods are always initiated as an effort to strengthen the growth of new research methods that can be accepted in academic circles.

The following is a discussion of research methods that have become a trend for students to choose them, namely the analysis of the aesthetic value and symbolic meaning of art objects. Aesthetic analysis and the meaning of symbols are part of a philosophical study that touches on the fundamental meaning of each of these cultural artifacts. This research method is an interpretation process, so that the meaning behind the image, color or some kind of doodles is found on a surface.

The historical study model in studying art such as design is divided into two groups, namely (1) a historical review of a particular work or art activity, (2) a review of the history of art. These two things in practice often overlap due to different understandings. In reviewing a work of art historically, historical research methods can be adopted as the main reference for compiling a 'map' of the development of a particular work of art, or for observing the phenomenon of various types of art in a certain period of time.

In the semiotic study model, works of art can be grouped into cultural formats, so that works of art can be viewed as a language that is more specifically known as visual language. By looking at works of art like this, it opens up opportunities for the development of semiotic theories as a means of 'dissecting' these works. The study of semiotics has become a trend in various universities as a new methodology in explaining aesthetic values.

The cultural transformation study model, the cultural transformation study model is broadly an observation of changes and shifts in the phenomenon of works of art within a certain range. During this period, it was observed and recorded the cultural changes that occurred as well as the acculturation and inculturation processes that occurred as well. In general, cultural transformation begins with an element of openness, both forced and by the ease of assimilation. In observing the phenomenon of art and culture along with observing the shift in ritual values and religious values into aesthetic values.

In the strategy study model, the development of art cannot be separated from how a nation builds its civilization, from infrastructure to superstructure, and the implementation of civilization development is manifested in various forms. For the extreme form of applying art strategies such as observing this, there are various study models that emphasize an economic strategy, and the development of a nation to build its civilization through works of art (Yusuf, 2014).

The research and development model, in this case research and development is aimed at learning tools and works of art. In learning arts and culture, especially fine arts, it is necessary to develop existing learning tools, which have been ineffective or have not touched the needs of students or students. Development of learning media, for example, making illustration drawing tutorials or drawing shapes with audiovisual guidance. In the development of works of art, for example, by painting using self-processed paints from various local leaves and fruits. This development research is very much needed, whether it is testing existing products or developing existing ones to make them more perfect and interesting.

2.4 Conceptual Framework

Textbooks are part of teaching materials and are the most important part in the learning process. Teaching materials are a set of learning materials that include curriculum content that must be mastered by students, arranged systematically and used in learning. Textbooks are one of the main forms of teaching materials used in schools and colleges. There are many approaches used in preparing teaching materials, but in this study the teaching materials were developed by loading textbooks as the delivery of material. The study begins with a more in-depth analysis of the needs of the research subject which will then be used as the basis for the formulation of the development of teaching materials that contain research models of art.

Researchers develop and apply teaching materials in the form of art research method textbooks as an effort to support the diversity of student thesis research themes. It is hoped that this textbook can be used as a guide to accelerate the graduates of the fine arts study program at FBS Unimed. Defining stage is useful for identifying and defining needs in the textbook and collecting product-related information (Handayani, 2020). The materials developed in this research are various models of art research. Before the textbooks are tested on students, experts in the research methodology material must first be validated, both in terms of content and the layout of a good book. After being deemed worthy, it will be tested on Fine Arts students sitting in the seventh semester who have finished or who are currently taking research methodology lectures.

Textbooks of art research methods will be able to help students to shorten the time to search for themes, and the thesis research model to be carried out. This textbook is able to direct students to determine the problems to be studied, meaning that students are no longer confused about finding a title or determining the research model for their thesis.

In class lectures, lecturers only rely on students' research problems with general research methodology books, which are not related to fine arts. One of the learning media in the form of textbooks which is expected to increase student interest is textbooks in the form of art research methods which are directly related to the research needs of their thesis.

III. Research Methods

The research model to be implemented is the Research and Development (R and D) model. This research is to develop a textbook of art research methods that will be applied to students in thesis research. The models and research methods carried out consisted of 6 models arranged in the form of Textbooks for the Art Research Methodology course for students of the Fine Arts Education Study Program.

Furthermore, the product development in the form of textbooks will be applied to Fine Arts students who will conduct thesis research. Research is conducted to design the product and conduct research to test the product design internally (opinions of experts and

practitioners). The test was carried out by research methodology experts on the design of the textbook. Is the textbook in accordance with the performance, work system, and usage process, is it suitable for students' needs to be produced into an ISBN book, and is a mandatory book in the Fine Arts Research Methodology course.

The population in this study were 7th semester students with 4 classes with a total of 72 people. The sample in this study consisted of 32 people or two classes, sampling technique with lottery technique, from four classes that have the same criteria or indicators were selected into two classes.

In developing learning media, this art research model uses a 4D (four-D) development model. According to Thiagarajan (1974) the 4D research and development model consists of 4 main stages, namely define, design, develop, and disseminate. According to Sugiyono (2017:37-38), the 4D development model starts from the needs analysis stage, product design, development to dissemination, namely the distribution of the product after being tested.

The 4D model was chosen because it is systematic and suitable for developing learning media in the form of textbooks. This research is divided into two stages. The first stage is the development of learning media in the form of textbooks. The development of learning media includes design in the form of textbooks, validation of subject matter content, and validation of learning media experts. The second stage in this research is to test the learning media to students and test its practicality and usefulness through a questionnaire.

Validity test is used expert opinion (judgment experts). The technique used to analyze the validation results is to see the feasibility given by material experts, linguists and design experts. The expert team will answer questions containing statements containing statements by putting a check list on the items that have been compiled with a score of 1-4. These criteria are converted into Likert scale values.

Textbook validity data analysis techniques. The results of expert analysis (experts) are used to determine the level of accuracy of the learning media developed, then the data is analyzed by calculating the percentage score of learning media / textbooks developed using qualitative descriptive, namely by looking at the feasibility assessment of learning media from the results of the study, then calculating the percentage score for each the criteria for the developed learning media, according to Sudijono (2012), the percentage of feasibility of the aspects assessed by the formula:

Table 1. Classification of Textbook Validity

Achievement Level	Classification Validity	Qualification
80% $X < 100\%$	Very valid	Learning media products are ready to be applied in the field for learning activities/no revision.
60% $X < 80\%$	Valid	Learning media products can be applied in the field for learning activities with revisions
40% $X < 60\%$	Quite Valid	Learning media products can be continued by adding something that is lacking, making certain considerations, the additions made are not too large.
20% $X < 40\%$	Less Valid	Revise learning media by re-examining carefully and looking for product weaknesses to be perfected.
0% $X < 20\%$	Invalid	The product failed, massively and fundamentally revised the product content.

(Sugiyono, 2017)

The learning media developed has a good degree of validity if it is at least in the 80% "valid" criteria. If the degree of validity is below valid, it is necessary to make revisions based on suggestions from the validator. And so on until the ideal learning media is obtained from the size of the content and construct validity. Then donetPractical data analysis techniques for Learning Media with the formula below

The average score of aspects can be calculated using the formula:

$$\text{Score percentage} = \frac{\text{Total Scores Obtained}}{\text{Max Score}} \times 100\% \quad (\text{Sugiyono, 2017})$$

Data analysis techniques on the effectiveness of learning media. For data on students' positive responses to the developed media, a student response questionnaire was given after finishing learning using textbooks. The data obtained using the Guntman scale of 1 and 0, where a value of 1 for the criteria of a positive answer and a value of 0 for the criteria of a negative answer, with the following formula:

$$PRS = \frac{\sum A}{\sum B} \times 100\% \dots\dots\dots (\text{Trianto, 2013: 243})$$

Where :

PRS : Percentage of many students who gave a positive response

$\sum A$: Proportion of students who choose

$\sum B$: Number of students (respondents)

From this formula, to determine the achievement of learning objectives in terms of student responses, it is said to be positive if the number of students who give positive responses is greater than or equal to 80% of the many subjects studied for each trial.

IV. Discussion

The implementation of this applied research begins with conducting a needs analysis for students majoring in art education at FBS Unimed which is carried out by informal interviews while teaching the Research Methods course. From the results of the needs analysis study, it can be concluded that there is a great need for books on art research methods that have various research themes. This textbook can help students understand the concept of learning in research methodology courses with various themes and research models.

From the results of interviews with students and lecturers, it was shown that 100% of students stated that they really needed art research method books with various research themes. As many as 3 people (100%) lecturers of research methodology courses stated that they really needed art research methodology textbooks, so that students in the learning process were more interested and enthusiastic in preparing their thesis research proposals.

Based on the needs analysis, it can be concluded that the development of art research methodology textbooks is really needed by students and lecturers in the learning process of research methodology courses in the seventh semester by students majoring in fine arts.

After obtaining data on learning needs from students and lecturers, the next step is to carry out a series of processes for developing textbooks for art research methods starting

from the steps of designing and developing textbooks. The textbook product will be applied to students of the fine arts study program who are in the seventh semester.

The materials presented in this textbook include: 1) steps of research on historical studies of art, 2) steps of research on semiotic studies, 3) steps of research on aesthetic studies, 4) steps of research on arts and culture studies 5) steps of research on multidisciplinary studies of art, 6) steps art development research.

The material presented in this teaching material is a learning support material that contains the main material which is entirely related to the themes of art research. The deepening of the material presented in this textbook is different from the usual because in addition to displaying the typical themes of art, it is also systematic about writing proposals and results (thesis). Thus, it is hoped that students will more quickly understand the theme of their research and at the same time be able to prepare a thesis research proposal.

After the initial product of this art research methodology textbook is compiled, the next step is to evaluate stage I, namely validating textbooks to research methodology material experts, and cover and layout design experts in order to produce textbook products that are feasible and interesting to apply. From the results of each validator then analyzed, then the product performs revision I. After that, stage II evaluation is carried out, namely conducting (1) individual trials, (2) analyzing individual trials, (3) revision II, (4) conducting tests small group trials, field trials to fine arts students (large groups), (5) analysis of the results of field trials, and (6) the final product, which will be followed by a product feasibility test.

Validation results from material experts. The four stages of research and development developed by Borg & Gall include: a. preliminary studies; b. planning stage; c. development stage; and D. validation and testing stage. In the information gathering stage, a needs analysis was carried out by means of observation and distributing questionnaires to 3 lecturers in charge of research methodology courses at the Department of Fine Arts, FBS Unimed thesis proposals to prepare reports.

Based on the needs analysis, information was obtained that so far lecturers and students have only used general research method books. So far, there has been no companion book, especially art research methodology books, especially fine arts. The results of the needs analysis also indicate that students and lecturers need a typical art research methodology book to help them determine the focus of their research and the methods used.

After the analysis stage, the researcher carried out the next stage, namely the design stage at the design stage, the design of the appropriate textbook draft was carried out based on the data obtained from the initial research stage or needs analysis. The drafting of textbooks is adjusted to the characteristics of textbooks that can be used independently by students.

Then at the development stage which is the main stage in making or compiling textbooks into a unified whole and reviewing experts, the purpose of reviewing by experts is to obtain input, criticism and suggestions for improvement for the perfection of the developed textbooks. Expert input as a reference for revision, besides filling out a validation questionnaire will determine the feasibility of the textbook to be tested on students.

The final product that has been successfully developed from this development is in the form of teaching materials in the form of Textbooks of Art Research Methodology which are designed to assist students in compiling theses, starting from determining the title topic then preparing proposals to compiling theses. With this textbook, it is hoped that students will not find it difficult to compose a thesis and can graduate on time.

Textbooks This developed design is designed to not only present theories and examples of titles, but also be able to stimulate interest in finding and determining interesting research titles with a variety of objects of art that are the object of research. With this textbook, students can learn independently in research methodology courses.

The criteria for preparing teaching materials in developing textbooks include five aspects, namely self-instructional, self-contained, stand-alone, and adaptive and user friendly. These criteria are used as guidelines for developing textbooks in terms of material, presentation, language and graphic components.

4.1 Feasibility of Textbooks of Art Research Methods

The development of textbooks is carried out in order to support the learning process. A good textbook should meet the eligibility criteria. To determine the feasibility of textbooks, validity tests were carried out by material experts, linguists and design experts. The validation carried out at the validity test stage is theoretical validity, namely the validity carried out by people who are considered experts, experienced in their fields and competent to validate based on theoretical or logical considerations. Expert validators provide an assessment of each indicator contained in the validation sheet. The data obtained from the assessment of material experts, linguists and design experts and material experts in the form of qualitative data were converted into quantitative data scores. The scoring rules are adjusted to the assessment using a Likert scale.

The results of the material expert validation showed that based on the assessed aspects, the developed textbooks obtained a percentage score of 85.1% with the "Good" criteria. Based on the analysis carried out, the revision of the textbook is to adjust the objectives and indicators based on KD and formulate indicators.

The results of the validation of linguists obtained that based on aspects of accuracy, communicativeness, suitability of language rules and suitability of student development, textbooks obtained a score of 92% with the criteria of "Very Good". This shows that the language used in the developed textbooks is in accordance with good and correct linguistic rules.

The results of the expert validation of the layout or display of the book obtained a score with a percentage of 83.3% with the criteria of "Very Good". This indicates that the design used in the developed textbook is feasible to be used in the learning process in terms of design.

Before obtaining eligibility as a textbook as above, it must have been revised by the validator. The suggestions given by the validator are used as input and guidelines for improving this textbook. This textbook media has been revised and improved with suggestions and input from the validator so that the questionnaire on the feasibility of the material, language and book presentation design obtains the results as described previously in semesters VI and VII.

4.2 Student Questionnaire Results on the Effectiveness of Textbooks

The effectiveness of textbook trials was obtained from the results of questionnaires to students. The questionnaire consists of 20 items addressed to 32 students consisting of two classes. As many as 100% of students said that this art textbook was very useful as a reference in preparing proposals. About 90% of students said the textbook was very useful and worthy of being used as a handbook. 90% of the readability and understanding of the contents of the book said it could be understood. As many as 100% of students said that textbooks can open students' horizons to determine the theme and title of the research. For various research themes, as many as 92% of students said that they just knew that art

research has many themes. From the conclusion of the questionnaire to the students, it was concluded that the research methodology textbook was very effective.

V. Conclusion

Based on the results of research and discussion, that the validity of textbook products from material expert validators with a two-time validation system obtained very valid results with an average score of 85.1% in stage I and 92.61% in stage II. Likewise, the results of the linguist validator who obtained an average score of 89.20 stage I and 92% stage II, and were declared very valid with a two-time validation system. The results of the validation of the learning design and layout design achieved an average score of 83.3% and 90.02% and were declared feasible to be applied. The conclusions of material, language, and layout experts stated that the assessment of the art research method textbook was declared valid and feasible to be applied as a compulsory textbook in the Department of Fine Arts Education, FBS.

Student responses to the contents of textbooks achieved decent and very useful results, so that they deserved to be a reference book for research methods for compiling students' final assignments, starting from determining the theme, title, preparing proposals to completing the thesis. In conclusion, the student response is positive. The effectiveness of the textbooks developed by using various research models of the likeness of learning devices developed in the very good category.

Based on the conclusions of the research above, it is suggested that the results of the development of this art research method textbook can be applied as a student and lecturer handbook in the art research method course. This book can contribute to broaden the knowledge of fine arts students in particular and the academic community in general.

References

- Cahyono, D. 2015. Pengembangan Perangkat Pembelajaran. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Gava Media
- Hamdani. 2011. Strategi Belajar Mengajar. Bandung: CV. Pustaka Setia.
- Handayani, S., et.al. (2020). The Effectiveness of Early Childhood Inclusive Education Textbook for Students of Inclusive Education Classes in UNIMED. Budapest International Research and Critics in Linguistics and Education (BirLE) Journal Vol 3 (1): 71-79.
- Maulidiana, Reh Bungana dan Saragi Daulat, 2017, Developing Interaktif Learning Media Based on Macromedia Flash Profesional 8 to Improve Students' Achievement of Civics, IOSR Journal of Research and Method in Education (IOSR-JRME) e-ISSN: 2320-7388. P-ISSN: 2320-737X, Volume 7, Issue 6 Ver. IV (Nov- Dec 2017) PP 46-55.
- Ratna, Kutha Nyoman, 2010, Metodologi Penelitian Kajian Budaya dan Ilmu Sosial Humaniora Pada Umumnya, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta.
- Sachari Agus, 2003, Pengantar Metodologi Penelitian Budaya Rupa, Erlangga, Jakarta.
- Sanjaya, W. 2010. Strategi Pembelajaran Berorientasi Standar Proses Pendidikan. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Saragi, Daulat, 2018, Pengembangan Tekstil Berbasis Motif dan Nilai Filosofis Ornamen Tradisional Sumatra Utara, Jurnal Ilmiah Seni dan Budaya PANGGUNG, Vol. 28 No. 2 Juni 2018, Institut Seni Budaya Indonesia Bandung. Hal. 161-174.
- Sudijono, Anas. 2012. Pengantar Evaluasi Pendidikan. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Sugiyono, 2017, Metode Penelitian & Pengembangan (Research and Development) Untuk

- Bidang: Pendidikan, Manajemen, Sosial Politik. cet ke-3, Alfabeta, Bandung.
- Thigarajan, S.Semmel, D.S. Semmel, M. 1974. *Instructional Development for Training Teacher of Espectional Children*. A. Sourche Book. Blomington: Indiana.
- Trianto. 2009. *Mendesain Model Pembelajaran Inovatif-Progresif, Konsep, Landasan dan Implementasinya pada KTSP*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Yusuf, Murni, A., 2014, *Metodologi Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif & Penelitian gabungan*, Prenadamedia Group, Jakarta.